



**Reducing the illegal cross-border trade of
protected wildlife from Vietnam to China**

Planning Workshop Proceedings

Ha Long city, Quang Ninh province

01 December 2009

Contents

Executive Summary 1

Workshop Agenda 2

ANNEX 1: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS 4

ANNEX 2: OUTLINE OF EXERCISES 5

ANNEX 3: PREPARATORY AGENCY QUESTIONNAIRE 11

ANNEX 4: PARTICIPANT QUESTIONNAIRE 21

ANNEX 5: OUTCOMES OF EXERCISES 25

ANNEX 6: OUTCOMES OF QUESTIONNAIRES 31

ANNEX 7: PHOTOS 36

ANNEX 8 Minutes 42

ANNEX 9 WORKSHOP OUTCOME ASSESSMENT 46

Executive Summary

On 1st December 2009, the Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) in co-operation with Quang Ninh's Forest Protection Department (QN FPD) office organized the Planning Workshop within the frame of the project 'Reducing the illegal cross-border trade of protected wildlife from Vietnam to China.'

The workshop was aimed to (1) develop a more detailed plan of project activities for Quang Ninh agencies, (2) prioritize key challenges and needs of enforcement agencies in strengthening illegal cross-border wildlife trade control in Quang Ninh province, (3) introduce the planned project and partners to provincial agencies, (4) collect information required from agencies to develop a current situation analysis for the province's enforcement agencies, and (5) identification of interagency cooperation mechanisms needed to improve the province's wildlife law enforcement effectiveness.

The workshop was attended by participants from national and provincial Forest Protection Department, Environmental Police, Customs, Border Army, Market Control, and representative from Interpol Vietnam.

In the one-day meeting, the participants were introduced to the Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) – Vietnam Program and its planned activities in Quang Ninh province in the aspect of wildlife trade control. Most of the meeting time was devoted to discussions, both at plenary and in group, at which participants from different agencies had chance to share their insights into the wildlife trade enforcement, to identify needs and opportunities for improving the province's enforcement of wildlife laws, and to identify areas of inter-agency cooperation improvement.

Through discussion sessions, participants were worked through province-specific enforcement issues, with focus on capacity building and enforcement priorities. Findings of the workshop are seen to provide critical inputs for WCS to develop the project activity design and work plan. At the same time, it was a fruitful forum for enforcement officers from different agencies at different levels to enhance their understanding about others and to promote their networking for future cooperation and collaboration.

These proceedings are compiled as a record of the meeting and contain original outputs from and minutes of the discussions.

Workshop Agenda

Time	Activity	Type	Delivered by
0730-0800	Registration		WCS, QN FPD
0800-0805	Introduction to participants and workshop agenda	Presentation	WCS
0805-0815	Opening speech	Presentation	QN FPD
0815-0845	Introduction to WCS and the scope of potential enforcement support in Quang Ninh	Presentation	WCS
0845-0915	The illegal Wildlife Trade in Vietnam	Presentation	WCS
0915-0930	Prioritising challenges facing your agencies	Plenary exercise	WCS
0930-0945	Tea break		
0945-1030	Assessing current vs. required capacity and resources for enforcing wildlife crimes	Plenary briefings	QN FPD, EP, Customs, BA, MC
1030-1130	Turning points: Planning effective actions to eliminate the illegal cross-border wildlife trade	Facilitated group exercise	WCS
1130-1330	Lunch		
1330-1400	Turning points: Planning effective actions to eliminate the illegal cross-border wildlife trade – Debriefing	Presentation	Group representatives
1400-1500	Inter-agency approaches to controlling illegal wildlife trade	Facilitated group discussions	QN FPD, EP, Customs, BA, MC
1500-1515	Tea break		
1515-1615	Inter-agency approaches to controlling illegal wildlife trade – Group presentations	Presentation	Group representatives
1615-1630	Conclusion and closing remarks	Presentation	WCS

1700-2000 Dinner

ANNEX 1: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

List of participants of planning workshop on Reducing illegal cross-border wildlife trade of protected species from Vietnam to China in Quang Ninh province

Halong, 01 December 2009

#	Name	Agency	Position	Telephone	Note
1	Nguyen Manh Quan	Enforcement division #1- Quang Ninh Customs	Deputy head	0988 492 555	
2	Dinh Dinh Dung	Mong Cai customs	Deputy head of enforcement unit	0912 903 495	
3	Nguyen Binh Lai	Market Control	Deputy head	0913 262 148	
4	Tran Van Thang	PC 15	Unit deputy head	0904 618 689	
5	Tran Duc Nhuan	QN FPD	Vice head of conservation division	0984 839 942	
6	Nguyen Van Khuyen	QN FPD	Head of Legislation division		
7	Le Van Thach	Mong Cai FPD	Head		
8	Tang Xuan Phuong	QN FPD	Deputy head		
9	Tu Tu Banh	QN FPD	Head of mobile unit and FP&C	0913 267 081	
10	Luu Thanh Quang	Traffic Police QN	Deputy head	0913 268 775	
11	Nguyen Ngoc Hien	Border army	Deputy head		
12	Nguyen Van Duong	EP	Deputy head		
13	Do Dinh Thach	EP	Team leader		
14	Nguyen Quang Thang	EP	Police		
15	Do Nhu Khoa	National FPD	staff	0912 202 338	
16	Nguyen Nam Hai	National Customs	staff	0915 150 150	
17	Le Kha Hong	C36	Team deputy head	0913 202 790	
18	Tran Huy Dong	C36	Staff	0915 124 079	
19	Vu Viet Trung	FPD Regional Office #1	Deputy director		
20	Tran Hung	FPD Regional Office #1	staff	0984 951 255	
21	Tran Thuy Nga	Interpol	staff	0122 828 4292	

ANNEX 2: OUTLINE OF EXERCISES

Exercise outlines

(1) Prioritising challenges facing your agencies (15 min)

Goal: To identify key challenges facing agencies in controlling illegal cross-border wildlife trade

Facilitation: Two facilitators (provide instructions, collect cards, and group and stick cards on board)

Equipment: Coloured cards, markers, double-sided tape, A0 paper to stick groupings on

Instructions:

- Participants are given three pieces of coloured card and pens
- Each of them is required to write down three top challenges facing their agencies as identified through their daily operations of controlling illegal WLT in the province. The challenges could be specific, and either technical or political. Examples of such include irrelevant articles in current regulations, political will, lack of particular knowledge and skills, lack of particular kinds of resources, etc.
- Facilitators should stress they should write the challenges and NOT the solutions
- 10 min is given to participants to complete their writing
- Facilitators collect the cards, group them in similar issues, give each group a title, and stick them by group onto the board
- In case of a vague/unclear writing, further clarification with the author could be sought.

(2) Assessing current vs. required capacity and resources for enforcing wildlife crimes (45 min)

Goal: To consolidate existing capacity and resources in the province to enforce wildlife crimes across all agencies and highlight gaps

Facilitation: Facilitator, note-taker

Equipment: Laptop/LCD projector, A0 paper/pens, questionnaire

Instructions:

- Prior to the meeting, enforcement agencies are asked to complete a short questionnaire on their departments existing resources/capacity to tackle wildlife crimes (See below) and bring to the workshop.
- A representative from each agency is invited to make a short 5-minute presentation on their current capacity to control illegal wildlife trade and what they feel are the key limitations of this, using the questionnaire as a minimum guide.
- During the presentations, and based upon the completed questionnaires, the facilitator will populate a comparative table across all agencies that will be projected for all participants to see.
- Following the presentations, the facilitator will summarise the fully populated table of existing capacity for wildlife crime law enforcement.
- The facilitator will then draw participants into a discussion about where they feel they are lacking in capacity/resources and what they would need to be adequate to controlling wildlife crimes, which will be added into the table.

Questionnaire on existing capacity and resources of law enforcement agencies (presented)

- Total number of staff
- Number of staff assigned to work (permanent and *ad hoc*) on wildlife law enforcement
- Number of mobile/taskforce enforcement units and staffing
- Number of border checkpoints/stations and staffing
- Number of anti-smuggling units and staffing
- Number of staff having background education in biology, ecology, environment science/management, law , and law enforcement
- Number of staff with professional training wildlife identification, wildlife protection laws, and law enforcement/investigation techniques
- Provincial/national training institutions for agencies (name, location, topics available, regular training topics)

- Annual agency budget for professional training programs, investigation, equipment, and analysis
- Enforcement cooperation agreements with other agencies

Questionnaire on existing capacity and resources of law enforcement agencies (not presented)

- Staff rotation
- Staff evaluation
- Positioning of wildlife trade issues in agency's agenda
- Provincial legislation/policy/program creating unfavourable conditions for agency's wildlife crime enforcement

(3) Turning points: Planning effective actions to eliminate the illegal cross-border wildlife trade in Quang Ninh province (90 min, incl. group debriefings)

Goal: To provide a forum for participants to discuss in details specific topics/areas of potential improvement/change, and to provide suggestion of corresponding practical enforcement/policy interventions

Facilitation: Four facilitators

Equipment: Four flip charts with A0 papers/pens

Instructions:

- Participants split up into four groups, ensuring each agency is represented among the four groups. Attention should be paid to ensure similar ranked officers (e.g. dept heads or vice-heads) are in the same group to help facilitate open discussion among the group
- Each group is given one of the following themes: Inter-agency co-operation, Knowledge & skills, Provincial legislation, Resources (\$\$ and people)
- Under each theme the groups will be given a number of key challenges they currently face (identified through the morning exercise and also through related studies)
- Each group will be assigned a facilitator to guide them through the process of designing innovative, new interventions to overcome the challenges their group is given.

- At the end of the exercise, each group is expected to provide in written form on A0 sheets and a short presentation for the other groups (i) statement of the intervention, (ii) a brief justifications, (iii) implementation plan and resources required, and (iv) anticipated difficulties
- Each group selects a group leader for discussion coordination and for later-on presentation
- The four facilitators support the groups with time keeping, note taking and keeping them on track with completing the exercise.

Potential problems for exercise

(i) Inter-agency co-operation

- Most challenging obstacle in current interagency cooperation between/among Quang Ninh's enforcement agencies, and how to overcome it
- Most relevant and feasible point(s) for change in order to improve the current Quang Ninh's interagency cooperation, and how to make it (them) happen
- Formal interagency cooperation mechanism: Bilateral or multilateral – which best fits in the province's context?
- In what way informal interagency cooperation most contributes to strengthening the province's wildlife law enforcement?

(ii) Knowledge & skills

- Most critically recognized knowledge gap (e.g. laws and law interpretation, WLT market knowledge, species and species identification knowledge, etc.) facing the agencies and practical measures to eliminate/narrow down the gap
- Two most wanted skills (e.g. investigation techniques, field survey, species identification, endangered species identification, etc.) in need for Quang Ninh's enforcement officers in order to more effectively monitoring cross-border wildlife trade

(iii) Provincial legislation

- Identifying discrepancies in provincial policies/programs, which are in contradiction with the goal of reducing illegal cross-border WLT, and recommending ways to handle these
- Identifying provincial legislation that may create unfavourable operational/coordinating conditions for agencies in order to individually or collaboratively tackle the illegal cross-border WLT, and recommending practical solutions
- The legislation that regulates the functions, mandate, power and organization of your agency: Are power and resources adequate to fulfil the mandate? If yes, provide manifestation. If not, provide clarification and solutions

(iv) Resources

- Most critical resource shortage (e.g. qualified staff, budget, equipment, etc.) facing your agency and in what way you think it can be best resolved?
- Observed resource redundancy/ies in the province's enforcement system, and advices to resolve it/them.

(4) Inter-agency approaches to controlling illegal wildlife trade (120 min, incl. group presentations)

Goal: To provide a chance for enforcement officers from relevant agencies to demonstrate their knowledge of and insights into cross-border WLT in Quang Ninh in a simulation exercise that goes closely to their daily work.

Facilitation: three facilitators

Equipment: Three flip-charts with A0 papers/pens

Instructions:

- Participants split up into three groups, ensuring each agency is represented among the three groups. Attention should be paid to ensure similar ranked officers (e.g. dept heads or vice-heads) are in the same group to help facilitate open discussion among the group
- Each group has to assign roles, responsibilities, budgets, and resources required to implement a sustained crackdown on one of the following enforcement priorities:

- 1) Wholesale wildlife traders operating in Quang Ninh province
- 2) Illegal wildlife trade at official border crossings (Luc Lam, Ka Long)
- 3) Illegal wildlife trade at unofficial border crossings
 - Each group presents their findings back to the other participants for inputs, and provides the findings in written form on A0 sheets following four sections: (i) statement of the intervention, (ii) a brief justifications, (iii) implementation plan and resources required, and (iv) anticipated difficulties

Facilitator leads a discussion for all to discuss what are the obstacles to these enforcement campaigns actually happening and what WCS and this project can do to help facilitate those changes?

ANNEX 3: PREPARATORY AGENCY QUESTIONNAIRE

Vietnamese version:

Giảm thiểu hoạt động buôn bán trái phép qua biên giới các loài động vật hoang dã được bảo vệ từ Việt Nam sang Trung Quốc

Hội thảo lập kế hoạch

(Thành phố Hạ Long, 01/12/2009)

Câu hỏi chuẩn bị cho phân thảo luận:

Đánh giá năng lực và nguồn lực hiện có so với năng lực và nguồn lực cần thiết để thực thi nhiệm vụ

Quý vị vui lòng trả lời các câu hỏi sau đây và gửi lại cho Ban tổ chức khi đăng kí đại biểu của hội thảo. Mỗi cơ quan tham dự hội thảo chỉ cần một (01) bản trả lời. Quý vị hãy viết câu trả lời vào ô thích hợp.

Tên cơ quan Quý vị:

(đánh dấu vào ô thích hợp)

Chi cục Kiểm lâm tỉnh

Cục Hải quan tỉnh

Phòng Cảnh sát môi trường – Công an tỉnh

Bộ chỉ huy Bộ đội biên phòng tỉnh

Chi cục Quản lí thị trường tỉnh

Địa chỉ liên hệ:

.....

Điện thoại: Fax:

1. Cơ quan của Quý vị có tổng số bao nhiêu cán bộ?

2. Số cán bộ trong cơ quan Quý vị chịu trách nhiệm thường xuyên về thực thi pháp luật liên quan đến các loài động vật hoang dã (ĐVHD)?

3. Số cán bộ trong cơ quan Quý vị không chịu trách nhiệm thường xuyên nhưng có thể tham gia vào hoạt động thực thi pháp luật về các loài ĐVHD khi cần thiết?

4. Cơ quan Quý vị có bao nhiêu đội cơ động và/hoặc đội đặc nhiệm?
 Tổng số cán bộ của các đơn vị này là bao nhiêu?
5. Cơ quan Quý vị có bao nhiêu trạm kiểm tra/kiểm soát ở khu vực biên giới?
 Tổng số cán bộ của các trạm kiểm tra/kiểm soát này là bao nhiêu?
6. Cơ quan Quý vị có bao nhiêu đơn vị chuyên về phòng chống buôn lậu?
 Tổng số cán bộ của các đơn vị này là bao nhiêu?

7. Có bao nhiêu cán bộ trong cơ quan của Quý vị được đào tạo về:
- Sinh học/Sinh thái học
- Khoa học môi trường/quản lý môi trường
- Luật
- Thực thi pháp luật

8. Có bao nhiêu cán bộ trong cơ quan của Quý vị được đào tạo/tập huấn nghiệp vụ về:
- Nhận dạng các loài ĐVHD?
- Luật pháp bảo vệ các loài ĐVHD?
- Nghiệp vụ thực thi pháp luật/kĩ thuật điều tra?

9. Ngành của Quý vị có trung tâm tập huấn cấp quốc gia hoặc cấp tỉnh mà cơ quan của Quý vị có thể cử người đi đào tạo/tập huấn hay không?

Nếu có, xin hãy ghi rõ:

Tên:

Địa điểm:

Các chủ đề/nội dung đào tạo/tập huấn được giảng dạy tại trung tâm này:

.....

Cán bộ cơ quan Quý vị thường xuyên được cử đi đào tạo/tập huấn tại trung tâm này hay không?

Nếu có, xin hãy nêu tên năm (5) nội dung được đào tạo/tập huấn thường xuyên nhất?

.....

.....
.....
10. Ngân sách hàng năm của cơ quan Quý vị là bao nhiêu (con số chính xác hoặc ước tính) cho các hoạt động sau:

Các chương trình đào tạo nghiệp vụ chuyên môn?

Điều tra?

Mua sắm trang thiết bị?

Tiến hành các phân tích/tổng hợp thông tin?

11. Cơ quan Quý vị có kí kết thỏa thuận hợp tác với các cơ quan khác hay chưa?

Nếu có, xin hãy ghi rõ:

(i) Tên thỏa thuận hợp tác:

.....

.....

Kí với:

(ii) Tên thỏa thuận hợp tác:

.....

.....

Kí với:

(Vui lòng sử dụng thêm giấy khổ A4 và đính kèm bản câu hỏi này nếu cần thiết)

12. Cán bộ của cơ quan Quý vị đã từng tham gia tập huấn/hội thảo tập huấn liên quan đến buôn bán ĐVHD hoặc thực thi luật pháp bảo vệ ĐVHD chưa?

Nếu có, xin hãy ghi rõ:

i. Ngày: Địa điểm:

.....

Tên khóa học/hội thảo:

.....

Số cán bộ trong cơ quan đã tham gia khóa học/hội thảo trên:

.....

Đơn vị tổ chức khóa học/hội thảo:
.....

ii. Ngày: Địa điểm:

Tên khóa học/hội thảo:
.....

Số cán bộ trong cơ quan đã tham gia khóa học/hội thảo trên:
.....

Đơn vị tổ chức khóa học/hội thảo:
.....

iii. Ngày: Địa điểm:

Tên khóa học/hội thảo:
.....

Số cán bộ trong cơ quan đã tham gia khóa học/hội thảo trên:
.....

Đơn vị tổ chức khóa học/hội thảo:
.....

(Vui lòng sử dụng thêm giấy khổ A4 và đính kèm bản câu hỏi này nếu cần thiết)

CÓ / KHÔNG

13. Cơ quan Quý vị có thực hiện luân chuyển cán bộ hay không?

Nếu có, xin hãy ghi rõ:

(i) Việc luân chuyển công tác của cán bộ được tiến hành xem xét và quyết định tháng một lần,

(ii) Việc luân chuyển công tác được thực hiện tối thiểu/tối đa đối với.....% trong tổng số cán bộ của cơ quan.

14. Lựa chọn nào dưới đây phản ánh đúng nhất về vị trí ưu tiên của vấn đề liên quan đến ĐVHD trong nhiệm vụ chung của cơ quan quý vị?

(Chỉ đánh dấu vào một ô thích hợp nhất)

Đứng đầu tiên

Đứng trong 5 vấn đề được ưu tiên hàng đầu

Đứng ở khoảng giữa trong số các vấn đề được ưu tiên

Đứng trong 5 vấn đề được ưu tiên ít nhất

Không nằm trong danh mục các vấn đề được ưu tiên

15. Theo Quý vị thì quy định, chính sách hoặc chương trình nào của tỉnh có thể chưa tạo điều kiện thuận lợi cho cơ quan Quý vị xử lý tốt hơn hoạt động buôn bán trái phép ĐVHD trên địa bàn tỉnh?

i. Quy định/chính sách/chương trình:

.....

Mô tả ngắn gọn điểm không thuận lợi:

.....

.....

Đề xuất thay đổi:

.....

.....

ii. Quy định/chính sách/chương trình:

.....

Mô tả ngắn gọn điểm không thuận lợi:

.....

.....

Đề xuất thay đổi:.....

.....

.....

iii. Quy định/chính sách/chương trình:

.....

Mô tả ngắn gọn điểm không thuận lợi:

.....

.....

Đề xuất thay đổi:

.....

.....

(Vui lòng sử dụng thêm giấy khổ A4 và đính kèm bản câu hỏi này nếu cần thiết)

Hết

English version:

**Reducing the Illegal Cross-border Trade of Protected Wildlife
from Vietnam to China**

Inception Workshop
(Ha Long City, 01 Nov 2009)

Preparation questions for the session
WL Law Enforcement Agencies in Quang Ninh (ii)

Please answer each of following questions. Write your answers in space provided.

Your agency:

Quang Ninh's Forest Protection Department

Quang Ninh Customs

Quang Ninh 's Environmental Police

Quang Ninh's Border Army

Quang Ninh's Market Control

Address:

.....

.....

Telephone:

.....

Fax:

.....

1. How many staffs in total are there in your agency?

2. How many staffs in your agency who are assigned to work on enforcing wildlife laws on a permanent basis?

3. How many staffs in your agency who are able to work on enforcing wildlife laws on a temporary basis (not on a permanent basis)?

4. How many mobile and/or taskforce enforcement units are there in your agency?

And how many staffs are there in total in these units?

5. How many checkpoints/stations on the border are there in your agency?

And how many staffs are there in total in these checkpoints/stations?

6. How many anti-smuggling units are there in your agency?

And how many staffs are there in total in these units?

7. How many staffs in your agency that have background education in:

Biology/Ecology	<input type="text"/>
Environment science/management	<input type="text"/>
Laws	<input type="text"/>
Law enforcement	<input type="text"/>

8. How many staffs are there in your agency that received professional training in:

Wildlife species identification?

Wildlife protection laws?

Law enforcement/investigation techniques?

9. Is there a provincial/national training center for your agency?

If yes, please specify:

Name:

.....

Location:

.....

Training topic available:

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

Are there regular training provided for your staffs?

If yes, what are the five most often training topics?

.....

.....

10. What is your agency's annual budget (exact or estimate) for

Professional training programs?

Investigation?

Equipment?

Analysis?

11. Has your agency signed cooperation agreements with other agencies?

YES/NO

If yes, please specify:

Title:

.....

signed with:

.....

Title:

.....

signed with:

.....

(Please use extra A4 sheets if needed)

12. Have there been intensive training courses/workshops in relation to wildlife trade or wildlife law enforcement, in which staff from your agency are attended?

YES/NO

If yes, please specify:

i. Dates: Place:

.....

Course name/workshop title:

.....

The number of staff from your agency attending the event:

.....

Course/workshop organizer(s):

.....

ii. Dates: Place:

.....

Course name/workshop title:

.....

The number of staff from your agency attending the event:

.....

Course/workshop organizer(s):

.....

iii. Dates: Place:

.....

Course name/workshop title:

.....

The number of staff from your agency attending the event:

.....

Course/workshop
.....

organizer(s):

(Please use extra A4 sheets if needed)

13. Are staff in your agency rotated from one unit to another?

YES/NO

If yes, please specify:

Staff rotation is undertaken everymonths,

Staff rotation happens to a minimum/maximum of% of staff total.

14. Which best describes the position of WLT issues in your agency's current list of enforcement priorities?

(tick one only)

Top	<input type="checkbox"/>
Top five	<input type="checkbox"/>
Middle	<input type="checkbox"/>
Lowest five	<input type="checkbox"/>
Not on the list at all	<input type="checkbox"/>

15. What provincial legislation, policy or program you think may create unfavorable conditions for your agency to better tackling the illegal WLT in the province?

i. Legislation/policy/program:

.....

Brief description of unfavorable:

.....
.....
.....

Suggested change(s):

.....
.....
.....

ii. Legislation/policy/program:

.....

Brief description of unfavorable:

.....
.....
.....

Suggested change(s):

.....

.....
.....
iii. Legislation/policy/program:

.....
Brief description of unfavorable:

.....
Suggested change(s):
.....
.....

(Please use extra A4 sheets if needed)

The end

ANNEX 4: PARTICIPANT QUESTIONNAIRE

Vietnamese version:

Hội thảo lập kế hoạch:

Giảm thiểu hoạt động buôn bán trái phép qua biên giới các loài động vật hoang dã được bảo vệ từ Việt Nam sang Trung Quốc

Thành phố Hạ Long, 01/12/2009

BẢN CÂU HỎI

Bản câu hỏi này được lập ra nhằm phục vụ cho việc phân tích và lập kế hoạch thực hiện chương trình hỗ trợ nâng cao năng lực cho các cơ quan thực thi pháp luật liên quan đến các loài động vật hoang dã tại tỉnh Quảng Ninh của Hiệp hội Bảo tồn động vật hoang dã. Xin Quý vị vui lòng trả lời tất cả các câu hỏi dưới đây, đúng và đầy đủ nhất có thể, và gửi lại cho Ban tổ chức trước khi Hội thảo bế mạc. Câu trả lời của Quý vị sẽ CHỈ được sử dụng cho quá trình lập kế hoạch như đã nêu trên, và những thông tin cá nhân sẽ KHÔNG được tiết lộ cho bên thứ ba trong bất kì trường hợp nào, trừ khi có sự cho phép của Quý vị.

Xin cảm ơn sự hợp tác của Quý vị!

A. THÔNG TIN CÁ NHÂN

1. Họ tên: Tuổi:
3. Chức danh và đơn vị công tác:
-
4. Địa chỉ liên hệ:
-
- Điện thoại CQ: ĐTDĐ:
- Email:

B. THÔNG TIN NGHỀ NGHIỆP

5. Quý vị đã làm việc cho cơ quan hiện tại được bao nhiêu năm?
- a. Dưới 1 năm
 - b. 1-5 năm
 - c. 6-10 năm
 - d. Trên 10 năm

6. Xin quý vị mô tả vắn tắt về công việc của mình:

.....

.....

.....

C. THÔNG TIN VỀ HOẠT ĐỘNG THỰC THI PHÁP LUẬT CỦA TỈNH

7. Quý vị nhận xét thế nào về tình hình buôn bán trái phép qua biên giới các loài động vật hoang dã được bảo vệ tại địa bàn tỉnh Quảng Ninh?

.....

.....

8. Theo Quý vị, hoạt động kiểm tra, kiểm soát hoạt động buôn bán trái phép qua biên giới động vật hoang dã được bảo vệ của các cơ quan thực thi pháp luật trên địa bàn tỉnh trong thời gian qua là:

- a. Rất hiệu quả
- b. Hiệu quả
- c. Hiệu quả còn hạn chế
- d. Không đánh giá được, lí do:

9. Theo Quý vị, khó khăn lớn nhất mà cơ quan Quý vị gặp phải khi thực thi nhiệm vụ liên quan đến các loài động vật hoang dã là?

.....

.....

10. Theo quý vị, để nâng cao hiệu quả thực thi pháp luật liên quan đến các loài động vật hoang dã thì cơ quan Quý vị cần có hoặc có thêm những yếu tố nào?

(liệt kê theo thứ tự ưu tiên giảm dần)

- i.
- ii.
- iii.
- iv.
- v.

D. VỀ CHƯƠNG TRÌNH CỦA WCS

11. Theo Quý vị, WCS nên tập trung hỗ trợ các cơ quan thực thi pháp luật của tỉnh ở những hoạt động nào trong số các hoạt động dưới đây?

- i. Tập huấn những nội dung cơ bản nhất hỗ trợ thực thi pháp luật liên quan đến các loài động vật hoang dã
- ii. Tập huấn chuyên sâu về một vài nội dung quan trọng
- iii. Tập huấn trực tiếp thông qua hoạt động kiểm soát/điều tra thực tế
- iv. Hệ thống hóa số liệu và phân tích số liệu phục vụ việc thực thi nhiệm vụ
- v. Hội nghị/hội thảo liên ngành về thực thi pháp luật liên quan đến các loài động vật hoang dã
- vi. Hỗ trợ xây dựng và kí kết các thỏa thuận hợp tác liên ngành của tỉnh
- vii. Đưa thông tin từ các cơ quan thực thi pháp luật đến báo chí và ra công chúng
- viii. Khác, xin nêu rõ:

12. Theo Quý vị, nội dung nào trong số những nội dung nêu dưới đây là cần thiết và thiết thực nhất trong đối với cá nhân quý vị và/hoặc cơ quan Quý vị trong các khóa tập huấn?

- i. Nhận dạng các loài động vật hoang dã hay được buôn bán
- ii. Nhận diện các sản phẩm hay được buôn bán có nguồn gốc từ các loài động vật hoang dã
- iii. Hoạt động buôn bán trái phép các loài động vật hoang dã trên qui mô rộng hơn và có liên quan đến địa bàn Quảng Ninh
- iv. Các văn bản pháp luật quốc gia liên quan đến các loài động vật hoang dã
- v. Các thỏa thuận quốc tế liên quan đến bảo tồn và giám sát buôn bán xuyên biên giới các loài động vật hoang dã và sản phẩm của chúng mà Việt Nam có tham gia
- vi. Kỹ năng điều tra cơ bản các vi phạm/tội phạm liên quan đến các loài động vật hoang dã
- vii. Khác, xin nêu rõ:

13. Theo Quý vị, thời gian một khóa tập huấn kéo dài bao lâu là thích hợp nhất?

- i. 2-3 ngày
- ii. 3-5 ngày
- iii. 5-7 ngày
- iv. Trên 7 ngày

14. Theo Quý vị, các khóa tập huấn nên tổ chức chung cho tất cả các cơ quan thực thi pháp luật của tỉnh (bao gồm Kiểm lâm, Công an, Hải quan, Biên phòng và Quản lý thị trường) hay tổ chức riêng cho từng cơ quan/nhóm cơ quan?

- i. Chung cho tất cả các cơ quan nói trên
- ii. Riêng cho từng cơ quan
- iii. Riêng cho từng nhóm cơ quan, cụ thể:

Nhóm 1:

Nhóm 2:

Nhóm 3:

Hết

ANNEX 5: OUTCOMES OF EXERCISES

1. Prioritizing challenges facing your agencies

This is a plenary exercise, designed to identify most challenges facing local enforcement agencies according to their perception.

All participants were given sufficient instructions. Each of participants wrote down their three most challenges on the color cards provided. These challenges were then sorted out and grouped by WCS staff under four headings: multi-agency cooperation, knowledge and skills, law and policy, and resources, which were used as leading topics for group discussions in the Exercise 3.

2. Assessing current vs. required capacity and resources for enforcing wildlife crimes

This is a plenary briefing session. One representative from each agency present at the workshop was to report to the audience brief information about his/her agency's current vs. required capacity and resources in relation to enforcing wildlife laws. Findings are as follows:

2.1. Quang Ninh FPD, by Mr. Tang Xuan Phuong, deputy head of QN FPD

Key points include:

- Quang Ninh as a transit point of wildlife before entering China; most of the transport come from the south and the Central.
- National wildlife regulations are adequately in place.
- Serious shortage of resources facing QN FPD include: lacking personnel (esp. quantity), limited budget, poor equipment (e.g. vehicles, communications, detaining space, etc.). In particular, no budget line or personnel allocated specially for wildlife-specific enforcement.
- Some obstacles in QN FPD wildlife law enforcement involve budget availability and financial regulations on informants, incl. weak incentives for informants

2.2. Quang Ninh Environmental Police, by Mr. Nguyen Van Duong, deputy head of QN EP ivision

Key points include:

- Wildlife-specific expertise as well as species identification skills among QN EP staff is limited, which challenges the EP officers in enforcing wildlife crimes.
- So far, QN EP often have FPD help in species identification.
- Most shortages facing QN EP are personnel capacity (i.e. wildlife-specific knowledge and skills), and forensic supports (e.g. sample test, budget for sample tests)

2.3. Quang Ninh Customs, by Mr. Nguyen Manh Quan, deputy head of Enforcement Division #1

Key points include:

- QN Customs have been in good cooperation with Border Army and FPD in controlling wildlife trade along the border, and in settling cases of wildlife violations/crimes
- In term of resources, QN Customs have those as needed to implement its control of international trade including that in wildlife, except for some knowledge in species identification
- Another challenge facing the Customs is the forensic supports (i.e. when sample test is needed).

2.4. Quang Ninh Border Army, by Mr. Nguyen Ngoc Hien, QN BA Command's staff

Key points include:

- QN Border Army are in charge of the province's border security, that includes monitoring and enforcing of all kinds of trade; and QN BA have no special force for wildlife trafficking
- So far, QN BA have had working relationship with QN FPD, to whom they transfer wildlife-related cases
- At present, QN BA have very limited, or even no, expertise on wildlife (no professional training for officers on wildlife, for instance)
- QN BA welcome and appreciate such professional training on wildlife trade conducted by WCS, at which the BA can have its officers attended.

2.5. Quang Ninh Market Control, Mr. Nguyen Binh Lai, deputy head of QN MC

Key points include:

- Domestic wildlife trade control falls under MC's responsibilities; however for the last few years, when all wildlife violations have been promulgated to be transferred to FPD for resettlement, QN MC staff appear to lose their motivation targeting wildlife crimes and violations
- Overlaps and gaps between and among agency's jurisdictions/mandates (e.g. FPD and other enforcement agencies) and differences in agency's vision/mission/ways of working are said to limit efficiency and effectiveness of wildlife enforcement in general and inter-agency cooperation in particular.
- QN MC appreciate any capacity building support in term of wildlife law enforcement

2.6. Quang Ninh Economic Police, by Mr. Tran Minh Thang, QN Economic Police Division

Key points include:

- There are no staff specializing on wildlife enforcement in the Economic Police division; and professional knowledge and skills for policemen with regards to wildlife crimes enforcement are thus required.

2.7. Quang Ninh Traffic Police, by Mr. Luu Thanh Quang, QN Traffic Police Division

Key points include:

- QN Traffic Police appear to be a key actor in cracking down wildlife crimes
- Critical challenges include limited ID skills among police officers, limited budget (while it is costly to organize a transport seizure, including high pays for informants), and loose cooperation between authorities of Vietnam and China when handling wildlife issues.

3. Turning points: Planning effective actions to eliminate the illegal cross-border wildlife trade in Quang Ninh province

Key findings include:

3.1. Multi-agency cooperation

Proposed actions include:

- Development of an inter-agency cooperation mechanism for provincial enforcement agencies to handle wildlife crimes
- Development of a cross-border cooperation mechanism between Quang Ninh authorities and China's counterparts

- Establishment of an inter-agency task force for the province's wildlife enforcement

QN FPD was proposed to be the focal point, who takes the lead and coordinates the development and implementation (if approved) of such proposals.

WCS committed to providing financial support for the development process.

3.2. Knowledge and skills

The group agreed the crucial actions in terms of knowledge and skills for effective elimination of illegal cross-border wildlife trade in the province include both awareness raising and capacity building.

While awareness raising is recommended to focus on the youngsters (i.e. school students) using both mass media and localized leaflet dissemination, capacity building is suggested to range broadly from species knowledge and product identification to investigation techniques and monitoring skills. Such training for capacity building could be either short (a couple of days) or long (more than 3 days), and should integrate fieldwork into training curricula. Bringing in experienced trainers from different institutions is recommended. Also, training materials should include identification guides, ideally pictorial/illustrative ones, relevant to enforcement officers. The group proposed the training-of-trainer course as a durable approach for long term purpose.

3.3. Law and policy

Key points include:

- Vietnamese laws on wildlife protection in general and on wildlife trade control are said to be adequate; the problem comes from the enforcement.
- In the enforcement process, agencies are seen to encounter various pressures, ranging from awareness of enforcement officers and other civil servants, public awareness, limited resources, economic and political interventions, and personal/working influence.
- Recommended tools include communications, clear definition of jurisdiction, mandate, and responsibility (agency and individual) (e.g. seniors should not intervene into juniors' jobs).

3.4. Resources

Most agencies confirmed their limited resources, which reduce their efficiency and effectiveness in enforcing wildlife laws. Specific proposal are:

- Increase the number of staff, including those who work on wildlife protection and trade monitoring
- Enhance the knowledge and skills of enforcement officers, especially in the areas of species identification, investigation techniques (e.g. FPD), and foreign languages
- Increase budget for enforcement, including financial supports from non-governmental donors, to, for instance, improve staff capacity and enforcement facilities (e.g. communications, storage of exhibits)

National FPD representative, in response to the provincial FPD discussions, reported that FPD has been approved to increase its personnel, and that the project of FPD personnel development is under way.

4. Inter-agency approaches to controlling illegal wildlife trade

This is a group discussion session, which provides chance for enforcement officers from different agencies to demonstrate their knowledge of and insights into cross-border WLT in Quang Ninh. The exercise requests groups to solve simulation problems, that is, coming up with a plan to handle the illegal trade involving (1) wholesale wildlife traders operating in Quang Ninh province, (2) wildlife import/export/re-export/transit at official border crossings (Luc Lam, Ka Long), and (3) wildlife transport at unofficial border crossings.

4.1. Wholesale traders

The group discussion resulted in an enforcement crackdown, named Operation Cobra, which demonstrates the whole procedure of a police-led operation, from undercover investigation through court conviction.

The operation proposes to take place within 2-4 months, involving Police (national and provincial), and Quang Ninh Customs and Border Army (30-50 staff) in the undercover investigations and all other enforcement agencies in the seizures.

Targets of the operations are some 10 wholesale traders in the province.

4.2. Illegal wildlife trade in Luc Lam and Ka Long border crossings

The group came up with two broad strategies, including strengthening cooperation with Chinese counterparts, and intensifying coordination between and among Vietnamese enforcement agencies (notably customs, border army, FPD) in monitoring the transport of coming consignments. No specific plan was made from this group's discussions.

Further information of interest is that Luc Lam and Ka Long are two official exit/transit points that are controlled by Border Army and Customs, and that most of customs procedures for exit consignments have been done somewhere else (e.g. Hai Phong Port). Customs/BA officers are requested to normally check the customs seal of consignments and the approved corresponding customs papers only.

4.3. Illegal wildlife trade at unofficial crossings along the border

The group stated that control of the trade/transport at points along the border is extremely challenging because of the long border running over remote mountainous areas with small number of population, the low living standard/poverty of local people, the low awareness among local inhabitants, and the limited human resources of the Border Army and Customs.

The strategies proposed by the group to tackle the trade include:

- Reducing poverty of local communities along the border, ideally on both sides, coupled with education campaigns. Such poverty reduction should take into account the sustainable livelihoods of local residents, in a way that takes them away from the illegal trade cross the border
- Coordinating joint actions of ground officers (Police, Border Army, Customs, FPD rangers)
- Preparing enforcement agencies (provincial and national Police and Border Army) with capacities required for leading actions of cross-border cooperation and collaboration
- Engaging in the cause various stakeholders on the ground, including village heads, communal authorities, and forest yards' civil defense corps.
- Raising awareness among local people and government officers of the issues
- Integrating strict enforcement with education

ANNEX 6: OUTCOMES OF QUESTIONNAIRES

1. Agency questionnaire

- Number of copies delivered: 05

- Number of copies collected: 05

Overall assessment

It is a first note that not all questions were answered; those questions concerning institutional settings and policy received no written response, except for one general recommendation from Quang Ninh Border Army.

Responses to questions of human resource are most informative and specific, which will be great input in designing training courses.

While most of Quang Ninh FPD staff have background in biology/ecology and have received professional training in wildlife and/or wildlife trade, officers from the others are mostly trained in law and enforcement; few of the latter received intensive training in species identification and wildlife-specific topics.

Criterion-based synthesis

Criteria	FPD	EP	Customs	MC	BA	TrP	EconP
Total no. staff	318	22	450	141	n/a		10
No. staff working on wildlife crimes law violations (permanent/ad hoc)	n/a	3/10	35/10	0/123	0/15 (units)	n/a	n/a
No. mobile units/staffing/stationed where	2 units/20 officers	0	2units/30 officers	2units/15 officers	3 units/30 officers	n/a	n/a
No. checking stations on border, road locations/staffing)	0	0	2 stns/15 officers)	n/a	25 stns/200 officers	n/a	n/a
No. anti-smuggling units/staffing/operation ranges	2 units/20 officers	0	2 units/60 officers	13 units/117 officer	n/a	n/a	n/a
No. staff with							

academic training in:							
Biology/Ecology	~250	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Environmental sciences/management	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Law	~250	18	n/a	30	n/a	n/a	n/a
Law enforcement	~250	n/a	n/a	115	n/a	n/a	n/a
No. staff with professional training in:							
Wildlife species identification	~30	1	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Wildlife protection laws	0	1	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Law enforcement/investigation techniques	~30	18	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Provincial/National training centres for your agency:	0	0	YES	0	n/a	n/a	n/a
Location			n/a		n/a	n/a	n/a
Topics available			n/a		n/a	n/a	n/a
Regular training provided to your staff?			YES		n/a	n/a	n/a
Annual budget available for:							
Professional training programs (hiring trainers etc)	n/a	n/a	n/a	VND 100 mil	n/a	n/a	n/a
Investigations (Transport, food & accom)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Equipment	n/a	n/a	n/a	VND 900 mil	n/a	n/a	n/a
Analysis	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Co-operation agreements signed with which other agencies	EP	FPD	0	YES (not specified)	0	0	0
Wildlife-specific professional training course attended by	1	2	1	0	0	0	0

officers							
-----------------	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Notes:

FPD = Forest Protection Department, Quang Ninh

EP: Environmental Police, Quang Ninh

Customs = Quang Ninh Customs

MC = Market Control, Quang Ninh

BA = Border Army, Quang Ninh

TrP = Traffic Police

EconP = Economic Police

n/a = not applicable or information not available

0 = NO or DO NOT HAVE

2. Participant questionnaire

- Number of copies delivered: 21

- Number of copies collected: 16

Synthesis

#	Theme	Specification	Frequency of choice
1	Overall situation of illegal cross-border wildlife trade in QN		
		complex/complicated, serious	11
		large scaled	2
		small scaled	1
		not known	3
2	QN enforcement so far		
		very effective	0
		effective	4
		limited effectiveness	11
		not known	1
3	Most challenges facing agency		
		species identification/wildlife knowledge	9
		concealed/undercover trade by nature	4

	limited budget	6
	forensic support	2
	rescue and/or storage service inavailability	1
	limited personnel	1
	cooperation from other agencies	3
	unclear regulations	4
	information/intelligence	1
	legal issues between two countries	1
4 Inputs required for better agency's enforcement		
	budget	8
	equipment and facilities	4
	personnel/human capacity	2
	Strict regulations/clear definitions	5
	intensive training	7
	inter-agency cooperation mechanism/policy	13
	cooperation with counterparts in neighboring countries	5
	accessible rescue center	2
	incentive regimes	1
5 Focus of WCS capacity building support		
	Basic knowledge and skills for wildlife trade enforcement	10
	Intensive training on selected topics	7
	training on topics arisen from actual cases (on the job)	8
	data review and analysis	1
	inter-agency meetings	8
	inter-agency mechanism formulation	3
	information outreach (to media and public)	5
6 Most demanded topics of training		
	species identification	14
	product and derivative identification	11
	illegal wildlife trade dynamics (QN and broader scales)	5
	national regulations	8
	international agreements of relevance	8
	basic investigation techniques	9
7 Training duration preferred		
	2-3 days	3
	3-5 days	10

		5-7 days	2
		>7 days	2
8	<i>Participant structure of training</i>		
		participants from all agencies in a training	11
		participants from only one agency in a training	5
		participants from groups of agencies in a training	1

Note: Rows of yellow highlight indicate options chosen by at least 50% of respondents.

ANNEX 7: PHOTOS

Selected photos of the workshop



Photo 1: Workshop opening session



Photo 2: **Mr Tang Xuan Phuong, Deputy Head of Quang Ninh FPD opens the workshop**



Photo 3: **Participants from Quang Ninh FPD**



Photo 4: **Participants from Quang Ninh Environmental Police**



Photo 5: **Group discussions**



Photo 6: Group presentation



Photo 7: Group presentation



Photo 8: Group discussions



Photo 9: Group presentation



Photo 9: **Mr. Scott Robertson, Director of WCS Vietnam Program concludes the workshop**

ANNEX 8 MINUTES

Planning Workshop: Reducing illegal cross-border wildlife trade of protected species from Vietnam to China in Quang Ninh province

Time: 800 – 1430 of the first day of December, 2009

Venue: The Quang Ninh People's Committee Guesthouse

Participants:

(List of participants enclosed)

Activities:

1. Introduction to workshop objectives, agenda and participants by Vu Phuong Manh

2. Opening speech by Mr. Tang Xuan Phuong - Vice Director of Quang Ninh FPD

- Welcome participants
- Summarize the Quang Ninh's physical and commercial context
- Introduce to wildlife trade in Quang Ninh and enforcement efforts made by the provincial enforcement agencies, including achievements in term of seizures and crackdown cases (Hundreds of seizures in wildlife trade (13499 wildlife ..bear, ;leopard, turtle...), tight cooperation between relevant agencies: 96 violations, 22 criminal treatments)
- Introduce the goal and contents of the workshop
- Open the workshop

3. Introduction to WCS and scope of potential enforcement support in Quang Ninh by Dr Scott Roberton, translated by Duong Viet Hong

- Introduce briefly to the hunting and trade in wild animals in general and in Vietnam
- Introduce to WCS: mission and approaches
- Introduce to WCS Vietnam Program
- Introduce to the project goal/objectives, scope of activities, timeline, and budget
- Introduce the workshop objectives and express WCS expectations from the workshop

4. Prioritizing challenges facing your agencies

- Plenary exercise
- MC explains the exercise: objectives, equipment, process and timeframe
- Each participant is given three pieces of color cards on which he/she writes down three most challenges facing the agencies
- Further instructions are promptly provided for participants
- 10 min given to all participants

- Cards are collected after 10 min, which will be then sorted out in 4 groups for group discussions that come later.

5. Tea break

6. Assessing current vs. required capacity and resources for enforcing wildlife crimes

6.1 Quang Ninh FPD, by Tang Xuan Phuong, QN FPD vice head

- Wildlife regulations are adequately in place
- Serious shortage of resources as for QN FPD: lacking personnel, limited budget, poor equipment (e.g. vehicles, communications, detaining space, etc.). no budget line or personnel for wildlife enforcement
- Report briefly bear farming issue in Quang Ninh as well as challenges handling the issue
- Wildlife transport stopped by QN enforcement come from the south and the central; QN as a transit point to China
- Obstacles in developing informant network because of limited budget and current regulations concerned, especially weak incentives available for informants

6.2 Quang Ninh Environmental Police, by Nguyen Van Duong, vice head of QN EP division

- EnvP has 22 staffs including 18 operation staffs
- Wildlife-related expertise as well as species identification skills among the staff is limited, often have FPD help in ID
- Facility (budget in testing wildlife samples, 3million dong/sample) and human resources are limited for applying professional skills (mobile phone recording will help much in tackling as the car license can be changed,)
- Refer to bear bile: Joint circular 19: no regulation on bear bile thus difficult in placement.

6.3 Customs Quang Ninh by Mr. Nguyen Manh Quan – Head of the Control Team #1

- There are 450 staffs including those in border stations
- Cooperate with border army, transfer to FPD
- Facility is adequate
- Limited trainees in professional trainings,

6.4 Border army

- Mr. Nguyen Ngoc Hien
- Main responsibility is national security in border areas; no responsibility inbound
- 300 staffs, in charge for all types of trade over border, no separate force for wildlife trafficking
- Transfer wildlife cases for FPD as no professional training and facility to tackle
- Propose WCS to consult on regulations and professional training for enforcement agencies

6.5 Market control

- Mr. Nguyen Binh Lai
- Wildlife control is one of their responsibilities but in some recent years they are not so much involved
- Motivation of staff is reduced as wildlife violations must be transferred to FPD.
- Conflict between agencies as of differences in procedures and ways of working → maintain FPD as focal points in wildlife dealing but should expand involvement and mandate of other agencies in wildlife tackling to better cooperate in controlling wildlife.

6.6 Economic police

- Mr. Tran Minh Thang
- There are 10 staffs in total

- No clear staff on wildlife control
- 6.7 Traffic police
- Mr. Luu Thanh Quang
 - Main responsibility: ensure traffic safety
 - Check transport of wildlife on the way (>5000kg wildlife: snake, birds, turtle, pangolin, over 20 cases since beginning of 2009)
 - Awareness and ID skill of enforcement staffs and the community is limited; should expose to mass media for broader audiences
 - Limited budget as it's so expensive to organize arresting on the way
 - Law is strict, adequate, and specific, yet causes difficulty in enforcement (specify characters of species thus costly in testing and checking). Informants are very important and significant but expensive → budget lack
 - Loose cooperation among bordering countries like VN and China

Manh asks national guests about plan for supporting provincial FPDs in budget and human resources

Nat'l FPD- Mr. Do Nhu Khoa: confirm law is ok, tight though some limitations

- Most challenges in cooperation due to limited budget
- Good cooperation in Quang Ninh and over the country
- Not lack in human resources as available cooperation from other agencies
- Plan: memorandum between EnvP and police, upcoming market control and FPD in forest management and protection
- Gov Decree regulates FPD to be the focal agencies in dealing with forest related cases but need cooperation in the process
- 23-25 organize training on new Decree across the country
- Budget is based on budget law, Nat'l FPD can't provide more budget, just get from projects; some provincial FPDs get more budget from fire prevention and control as there are upcoming project on this.

7. Exercise 3: Participants write three key challenges in tackling wildlife trade

- MC explains on the task
- Each participant is given three cards and has 5 minutes to write down three challenges in tackling wildlife trade that they think are the biggest.
- Organizers collect the card and group similar issues into one big group

8. Lunch

9. Exercise 3 (continued)

- MC divides participants into four groups relatively with four big problems grouped previously
- Participants sit in group and discuss about solutions for issues assigned to the group in 1 hour
- Each group send a speaker to present the solutions they find out

Presentation

Group 1: Multi-agency cooperation

- Scott response: stress on support of WCS: in government meeting to build the regulation

Group 2: Knowledge and skills

- Le Van Thach- Mong Cai FPD
- Present difficulties in checking, discovering wildlife illegally transported
- Stress that that enforcement staff should be allowed to quickly check the transport mean without following admin procedures.
- Present solutions: provide ID books with illustration or photos
- Addition: training on investigation, especially the behaviors or communication skills so that not creating aggression from the suspects

Group 3: Law and policy

- Mr Do Nhu Khoa:
- Law on wildlife protection is adequate, problem is just in the enforcement
- Difficulty is from awareness/capacity of enforcement staffs or pressure on enforcement staffs (impacts from other people/connection)
- How to do? By communication, improve responsibility of leaders→ should not deeply intervene the settlement of the lower staffs

Group 4: Resources

- Mr. Nguyen Van Khuyen- QN FPD
- Increase staffs
- Staff for wildlife control is limited in professional knowledge like ID, investigation, foreign language (give example of the mistranslation of cow horn to buffalo horn, that leads to expense in doing test)
- Budget is very significant. Agency has two sources of budget; one is from the state and followed state budget law→ lack to build storage for keeping exhibits from admin violations
- Wish to be supported with budget, WCS might give budget to build communication system or buy facilities

MC ask Nat'l FPD representative on feedback to request of QN FPD

Feedback: Do Nhu Khoa said PM agreed to increase human resources for FPD (1 staff/1000hectares) → FPD was developing project on building FPD force

10. EX4: Case study

- MC regroup the participants into three groups to discuss on specific cases to find practical solutions
- Three groups discuss for 1 hour about solutions for dealing with three big issues: wholesale traders; illegal trade in Luc Lam and Ka Long border gate in 45 minutes;

11. Teabreak

- Groups will send a speaker to present the discussion results

Group 1: Wholesale traders

Group 2: Illegal trade in Luc Lam, Ka Long border gate

- Luc Lam: border army and customs- products through here is only monitored and escorted as customs procedures are done in Hai Phong already.

Solution:

- Collect information, cooperate with border army and customs
- Strengthening checking and monitoring

Group 3: illegal cross-border trade in wildlife in illegal crossings

- Difficulties: Long border, non-dense population, low education, limited human resource: customs, border army

Solution:

- Communicating by village heads to remote areas, communicate to other agencies also
- Stress on improving livelihoods of the community
- Cooperate with militiaman
- Strict settlement

12. Workshop Close

- Dr. Scott Robertson
- WCS will take all information today and put in a plan to submit to PC,
- Thanks to all participation of all participants and support of Quang Ninh FPD and PC
- Hope to prepare a detailed plan to tackle wildlife trade in QN, make QN as a model in controlling illegal wildlife trade.

ANNEX 9

WORKSHOP OUTCOME ASSESSMENT

Planning workshop:

Reducing the illegal cross-border trade in protected wildlife from Viet Nam to China in Quang Ninh province

Ha Long city, 01 December 2009

I. Workshop preparation

I.1. Collaboration from the workshop co-host

After receiving approval from Quang Ninh People Committee, Quang Ninh provincial Forest Protection Department (FPD)- the workshop co-host assigned staffs to work closely with the Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) in making plan and preparation of the workshop. During the workshop preparation, workshop direct organizers also received frequent and close instructions from the provincial FPD leaders regarding administrative procedures and workshop organization.

I.2. Workshop agenda development and logistics

The workshop co-hosts had worked together closely and frequently during the development of workshop organization, agenda, participant list; assigned detailed tasks for each partner; and timely dealt with emerging problems. WCS also received adequate support and cooperation from the co-host regarding administrative procedures to local agencies.

I.3. Workshop implementation

The workshop occurred at time and place as agreed by the two hosts. The workshop agenda was also strictly followed in actual implementation.

In terms of workshop participants, all invited agencies sent representatives to attend the workshop except for the People Committee. Actual participants are five less than the tentative ones (27 out of 32). The five absents were one from the People Committee (out of one invited representative), three from Quang Ninh Customs Dept. (out of five invited) and one from provincial border army (out of two invited).

Logistics take-care for participants including arrangement of accommodation and travel for far-away participants and food for all participants were well done by the organizers. With three participants from Mong Cai, because the accommodation supplier (People Committee Guest House) did not arrange rooms for them as agreed, WCS had also paid accommodation and travel cost for them at the announced norm.

Workshop room and supporting facility were well prepared to meet the requirement of the workshop. Participants were comfortably seated in group work and plenary talks. White boards, Ao, clips were also carefully prepared.

Materials distributed to participants were also carefully prepared. Participant registration and support were also well done.

II. Workshop outcome

During the workshop, the workshop agenda was basically followed and achieved tentative outcomes, specifically as follow:

- All participants joined all workshop activities with enthusiasm and responsibility such as plenary reporting, group discussion and group presentation;
- Participants were introduced and provided with necessary information about the program *Reducing the illegal cross border trade in protected wildlife from Vietnam to China* that WCS planed to conduct in Quang Ninh;
- Participants specified challenges for which priority should be put on finding solutions in the willdife enforcement of their agency;
- Through the workshop participation and performance of invited agencies, WCS could basically assess current resources of the provincial wildlife enforcement agencies, identify general requiries of all agencies and specialized requiries of each agency, as well as understand their potentiality and participation extent to WCS program;
- Through participants' ideas, group discussions, and questionnaires in the workshop WCS has identified priority contents for the capacity improvement training for wildlife enforcement agencies in Quang Ninh, including knowledge about species, species ID skills, and investigation techniques;
- Participants discussed about advantages, challenges and cooperation between wildlife enforcement agencies in the province and in the country and stressed on their care for the actual cooperation in the province; and
- Ideas and findings from group discussion activities are important inputs for WCS to design specific and practical activities for the program in Quang Ninh.

Through discussions in the workshop, some specific issues were participants cared and pondered as follows:

(i) Lack of human resource, facility and fund

Participants said that for almost law enforcement agencies in the province, human resouce for wildlife enforcement was very limited both in quantity and quality. For instance, total wildliffe enforcement staffs of the provincial Forest Protection Department which took the lead in forest management (including wildliffe) was much limited while the management area was large and posed many challenges as this was the key area for goods import, export and transit activities between Vietnam and China.

The workshop also helped understand better the lack of facility of local law enforcement agencies (such as communication and transport facility of FPDs).

Funding was the issue with high interest from participants. According to participants, financial difficulties such as limited amount of fund and unadequate current allocation and use of fund (such as payment for informants) made law enforcement agencies face lots of difficulties in organizing investigation, monitoring, fighting against willdife crimes.

(ii) Knowledge and skills

Participants from almost agencies said both basic and in-depth knowledge and skills relating to wildlife enforcement of their officers remained lots of limitations. For instance, the number of staff of law enforcement agencies, except for the FPD, having in-depth knowledge on biology, environment, and wildlife ...was small. Limited skills in identifying wildlife and their products of these agencies were also a big abstacle in the law enforcement. Many ideas stressed on the demand for not only advanced capacity strenthening training for law enforcement officers, but also materials of species ID and species products ID, especially kind of materials assiting officers in the field.

(iii) Inter-agency cooperation

Through participants' ideas and group discussions, inter-agency cooperation issue was mentioned as a challenge that also needed adaquate attention. Basically, there was cooperation at various levels and forms between provincial law enforcement agencies in general law enforcement and particular wildlife law enforcement activities. This cooperation helped improve effectiveness of law enforcement in the locality, demonstrated by the number of confiscation and settlement cases that involved many local law enforcement agencies and time needed to complete the case. However, some thought that the inter-agency cooperation effectiveness could be strengthened and that the effectiveness assessment of the recent cooperation had been ambiguous and far from the reality. They also said the unclear responsibility allocation between competent agencies sometimes reduced motivation of enforcement officers from relevant agencies in fighting against wildlife crimes.

(iv) Law enforcement

One issue getting lots of interest from participants in the workshop was the legal frame and current law enforcement issues. During the discussion, many said Vietnam law had already had relatively adequate regulations to adjust behaviors relating to wildlife and enough strong policies to control wildlife crimes, but that the biggest challenge to law protection agencies was not lack of legal tools but how to enforce correctly and strictly the available law. The improvement of capacity for law enforcement officers and inter-agency cooperation was considered to be fully effective only if it was taken together with strenthening the political will of the government, reducing poverty of the community and raising public awareness about wildlife.

