

CEPF Final Project Completion Report

Organization Legal Name:	Wildlife Conservation Society
Project Title:	Strengthening Community Based Coastal and Marine Resource Management in the North Sulawesi Corridor
Grant Number:	65951
CEPF Region:	Wallacea
Strategic Direction:	4 Strengthen community-based action to protect marine species and sites
Grant Amount:	\$124,249.00
Project Dates:	January 01, 2016 - December 31, 2017
Date of Report:	February 28, 2018

Implementation Partners

List each partner and explain how they were involved in the project

The implementation partners of this project are:

- 1. Dinas Kelautan dan Perikanan (Marine and Fisheries Agency of North Sulawesi).** In general, the DKP involved in: (i) Provide supports for implementation of CB-MPA management plan and surveillance activities; and (2) Facilitated series of socialization meetings that disseminating information of CB-MPAs to other stakeholders and wider communities.
- 2. Law Bureau of North Sulawesi Province.** Law Bureau of North Sulawesi assisted the development of legal documents related with CB-MPA establishments.
- 3. Balai Pengelolaan Sumberdaya Pesisir dan Laut (Marine and Coastal Resources Management Agency, under the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries).** During the project implementation, the BPSPL had been actively work with WCS field team to disseminate information about the list and regulations of protected marine species during community meetings in the vilages.
- 4. Village authorities.** The village authorities have been working together with WCS team to: (i) select member for MPA manageent units, (ii) facilitate community meetings to develop CB-MPA regulations, and (iii) allocate village fund to support CB-MPA planning process.
- 5. CB-MPA management units.** Collaborate to develop MPA management plans, implementing MPA management and regular community-based surveillance.

Conservation Impacts

Summarize the overall impact of your project, describing how your project has contributed to the implementation of the CEPF ecosystem profile

This project has resulted several key impacts for the improvement of protected area status and management capacities of local communities of the targeted villages in North Sulawesi. This project has successfully facilitated development of management status and capacities of five existing community-based MPAs (CB-MPAs) in North Minahasa and establishment of five new CB-MPAs in Sitaro. This process was initiated through baseline data collection on biophysical and socioeconomic at the 10 targeted villages in early 2016. The results of baseline assessments were disseminated to local communities and key stakeholders to build awareness of the ecological and socioeconomic condition of the targeted areas for CB-MPAs. The results from baseline assessments were then used to identify potential area for new CB-MPA at five villages in Sitaro, and baseline information to develop CB-MPA management plans for the CB-MPAs.

We have made significant results to improve the CB-MPAs management capacities and legal status through series of workshops and technical assistance for the village authorities to: (i) issue village decrees for the legal status of CB-MPAs; (ii) develop MPA management plans; (iii) establish MPA technical management units at village level; (iv) provide training and develop SOP for community based surveillance; and (v) build MPA boundaries. During the first semester of second year of the project (January to June, 2017), we focused on: (i) strengthening the legal status of the CB-MPAs, (ii) formed/revitalized CB-MPA management units, (iii) legalization of MPA management plans by village authorities, and (iv) development of SOP for community based MPA surveillance and enforcement. We also facilitated the deployment of MPA boundaries and continued the education program at schools. In addition, during the second semester of second year, we have facilitated the improvement of CB-MPA management plans at 10 targeted villages in North Minahasa (Desa Lihunu, Tambun, Tarabitan, Pulisan dan Tanah Putih) and Sitaro (Makalehi induk, Makalehi Timur, Tapile, Motole dan Mohongsawang). The management plans have also been legalized by village authorities. In addition, we also facilitated the legal processes of the CB-MPA management units, and all the management units of each CB-MPAs have been also legalized through village decrees.

The Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) of community based surveillance has been developed for the 10 targeted CB-MPAs. The SOP consists of four main procedures: (i) surveillance/patrolling preparation and safety; (ii) technical guideline of community surveillance; (iii) procedures for enforcement of MPA regulations; and (iv) surveillance/patrol logbook. Currently, we are assisting the CB-MPA management units to disseminate the SOP to local communities and testing the implementation of SOP.

As part of the project outputs, we also facilitated the deployment of mooring-buoys for MPA boundaries. Since early 2017 we have been facilitating the deployment of MPA boundaries for 5 targeted CB-MPAs in North Minahasa. Although project's target to deploy 5 MPA boundaries in North Minahasa have been achieved (Lihunu, Tambun, Tarabitan, Pulisan, Tanah Putih), by far we have also facilitated deployment of MPA boundaries at other 2 CB-MPAs in Sitaro, the Makalehi and Motole Villages.

On-job training for local NGO staffs from Manengkel Solidaritas and Rumah Ganesha runs well. During the implementation of this project we have been involving 2 staffs from each NGO. Each NGO staff work together with WCS staffs and directly involved in the project activities in the field. The on-job training focuses on improving the NGO staffs capacities in terms of: (i) communication with communities and facilitation techniques of community meetings, (ii) understanding of community-based marine protection (community based MPA), (iii) MPA

management planning process, (iv) development of SOP for community based MPA surveillance and enforcement, and v) understanding of existing marine and coastal management issues in North Sulawesi. The financing for the NGO staffs on-job training is done through sub-grant mechanism with the NGOs (Manengkel Solidaritas and Rumah Ganesa).

Planned Long-term Impacts - 3+ years (as stated in the approved proposal)

Impact Description	Impact Summary
1) Improved marine ecosystem habitats for nine priority species	The implementation of CEPF Project 65951 during 2016-2017 in North Sulawesi aims to increase community capacity in the 10 assisted villages in developing and managing community based MPA (CB-MPA) in their areas. Through this project WCS was supporting communities to strengthen the legal status of CB-MPAs through village decrees, establishing MPA management units, developing MPA management plans, and building participatory community-based surveillance. In the second half of 2017, most of the MPA management units have been conducting trials of MPA surveillance to combat the threat from destructive fishing activities in the coastal areas of their villages. Despite the limitations of facilities, infrastructure, and funding, based on the evaluation in December 2017 the communities and the MPA management units stated that the cases of destructive fishing activities declined significantly. In addition, the Tarabitan Village community said that the positive impact of the existence of MPA began to be seen with the increasing fish abundance (including juveniles) and pelagic fish entering the MPA area. However, to measure the impact of the management of MPAs, ecological and socioeconomic monitoring should be conducted and compared with the baseline data taken in 2016.
2) Positive economic benefits realized in ten villages, affecting 100 people, from CB-MPAs delivering increased sustainable fish-catch and tourism.	The short-term goal of this project is not directly aimed at providing positive economic benefits to communities in 10 villages. However, in the long term, the impact of improved ecosystem conditions should potentially improve economic benefits from fisheries as well as potential cooperation with tourism businesses in establishing marine tourism activities in some of these villages.

Planned Short-term Impacts - 1 to 3 years (as stated in the approved proposal)

Impact Description	Impact Summary
1) Ten villages with legally designated and fully functional CB-MPAs covering	Since 2016 the CEPF project in North Sulawesi has successfully assisted 10 villages in North Minahasa and

<p>approximately 185 hectares</p>	<p>Sitaro in enhancing coastal resource management capacity through the establishment of CB-MPAs. Five villages in North Minahasa (Tambun, Tarabitan, Lihunu, Tanah Putih, and Pulisan) have renewed the legal status of MPAs through revisions of village decrees. Furthermore, five targeted villages in Sitaro (Makalehi Timur, Makalehi, Matole, Tapile, and Mohongsawang) have legalized the establishment of new CB-MPAs through village decrees. To strengthen the capacity of MPA management, the project has successfully facilitated the establishment of MPA management institutions, development of MPA management plans, the development of SOPs for participatory community based surveillance. All the processes for establishing the 10 MPAs were finalized early in the 2nd half of 2017, so that the MPA management activities are currently in the initiation stage, in particular socialization of MPA regulations to local community and surveillance. At this stage the MPA management can not be implemented optimally due to limited infrastructure and funding.</p>
<p>2) Ten village governments, two district governments, and two local NGOs collaboratively managing a functional CB-MPA Network</p>	<p>The short-term goal achieved by the 2-year project implementation is the strengthened role of village authority and community in managing the CB-MPAs. The project achievements have been also communicated to the provincial government (DKP - Marine and Fisheries Agency) of North Sulawesi, and they are committed to recognize the existence of CB-MPAs in the provincial MPA management plans (North Minahasa and Sitaro MPA), which are planned to be completed in 2018. The recognition of CB-MPAs in the provincial MPA management plans allows the provincial government to provide assistance and support to the village authorities and communities to strengthen the management of CB-MPAs. On the other hand, the programmatic limitations of 2 local NGOs that have been involved in this project means that they have not been able to collaborate on the management of CB-MPAs in 10 target villages.</p>
<p>3) Approximately more than 100 community members and 4 local NGO staffs with improved skills in the management of their marine resources.</p>	<p>The main activities of this project is to provide assistance to the village authorities and communities to develop CB-MPA management plans and implementing community-based MPA surveillance. The activities during project implementation (assistance, meetings, and training) were involving village authorities, members of CB-MPA management units, and local communities. More than 100 community members have been involved in these processes as well as improving their knowledge and understanding of</p>

	coastal resource management. Furthermore, the project also involved 4 local NGO staffs through an on-job training for over 18 months to gain knowledge and understanding on coastal resource management and conservation as well as experience in community engagement processes.
--	---

Describe the success or challenges of the project toward achieving its short-term and long-term impact objectives

Several key successes and challenges during the project implementation are as follows:

- This project has successfully assisted 10 villages in North Minahasa and Sitaro to improve their capacity in natural resource management through establishment and management of community-based MPA. This led to improved community awareness in the targeted villages and adjacent villages where indicated by reduced number of destructive fishing activities using blast fishing and poison (bori: local language of natural substance for fishing) in most of the CB-MPAs. In addition, this is also confirmed by the reports from MPA management units that violation to MPA regulations were no longer done by local villagers, but foreign fishers.
- Some of the MPA management units are beginning to be self-sufficient in seeking sustainable financing. For example, funding to support MPA management in Tarabitan Village has been budgeted from the village fund budget since August 2017, whilst some others will receive funding by 2018 from the same source. In addition to the village fund budget, some of the management units have been also approaching the local government and private sectors for supports.
- The greatest challenge we faced during the project implementation was the limited facilities and funding to support the MPA management plan implementation. For example, although the implementation of community-based surveillance have shown success in some villages, lack of facilities and operational budget hindered the effective surveillance activity in most villages. However, this effort have been supported by other law enforcement institutions (Police, Marine Safety Board), and within the last five to six months the community surveillance group have found several violation cases such as destructive fishing, fishing in no take area, and cooperated with police and the Marine Safety Board to follow up on the offenders.

Were there any unexpected impacts (positive or negative)?

Two positive impacts were not anticipated during the project planning and implementation, are as follows:

- As the communities starting to witness the positive impact of MPAs, local community from Tambun, Pulisan, and Linuhu express their willingness to increase the area of their MPAs.
- According to fisher's observations from several villages, the abundance of fish populations in the CB-MPA increased, as they found new fish juveniles and the large fish size are improved. They also reported sightings of pelagic fish more frequent inside the MPAs.



Project Components and Products/Deliverables

Describe the results from each product/deliverable:

Component		Deliverable		
#	Description	#	Description	Results for Deliverable
1	Assess, gather and disseminate information on ecological, socioeconomic and governance conditions for developing effective coastal and marine resource management.	1.1	Report on ecological, socioeconomic and governance status of 10 targeted villages.	No update. Already finished and reported in the previous progress report.
1	Assess, gather and disseminate information on ecological, socioeconomic and governance conditions for developing effective coastal and marine resource management.	1.2	Report identifying priority social and economic incentives most appropriate for full support and adoption of each CB-MPA	No update. Already finished and reported in the previous progress report.
1	Assess, gather and disseminate information on ecological, socioeconomic and governance conditions for developing effective coastal and marine resource management.	1.3	Database of ecological, socioeconomic and governance status of 10 targeted villages.	No update. Already finished and reported in the previous progress report.
1	Assess, gather and disseminate information on	1.4	Report of data and information	No update. Already finished and reported in the previous progress report.

	ecological, socioeconomic and governance conditions for developing effective coastal and marine resource management.		dissemination events.	
2	Develop and strengthen community institutions and regulations for the establishment and management of community based MPAs, recognized by district and provincial governments.	2.1	Formed/revitalized community institutions of CB-MPA management unit at 10 villages (legalized by village authority).	Ten CB-MPA management units have been established and legalized by Village Head decrees.
2	Develop and strengthen community institutions and regulations for the establishment and management of community based MPAs, recognized by district and provincial governments.	2.2	Legalized CB-MPA management plan and regulations at 10 villages (legalized by village authority).	The 10 CB-MPA management plans have been finalized and legalized by Village Head decrees.
2	Develop and strengthen community institutions and regulations for the	2.3	Recognized legal status of CB-MPAs in District MPA management plans.	Until December 2017, the development of an MPA management plans for North Minahasa District and the legalization of Sitaro MPA were halted, hence the inclusion of existing CB-MPAs in the MPA management plan cannot be achieved. In 2017 the Marine and Fisheries Agency (DKP) of North Sulawesi was focused on

	establishment and management of community based MPAs, recognized by district and provincial governments.			the transfer of management authority from district to provincial government. Because of this all district MPAs will be managed by the Province and district management plans will not exist. We have conducted informal meetings with the DKP of North Sulawesi in December 2017 and agreed to continue the process of MPA management planning for North Minahasa and Sitaro MPAs in 2018, including to make sure that the existing CB-MPAs will be recognized within the North Minahasa and Sitaro MPA management and zoning plans.
2	Develop and strengthen community institutions and regulations for the establishment and management of community based MPAs, recognized by district and provincial governments.	2.4	Recognized legal status of CB-MPAs by district and provincial government.	Until December 2017, the development of an MPA management plans for North Minahasa District and the legalization of Sitaro MPA were halted, hence the inclusion of existing CB-MPAs in the MPA management plan cannot be achieved. In 2017 the Marine and Fisheries Agency (DKP) of North Sulawesi was focused on the transfer of management authority from district to provincial government. Because of this all district MPAs will be managed by the Province and district management plans will not exist. We have conducted informal meetings with the DKP of North Sulawesi in December 2017 and agreed to continue the process of MPA management planning for North Minahasa and Sitaro MPAs in 2018, including to make sure that the existing CB-MPAs will be recognized within the North Minahasa and Sitaro MPA management and zoning plans.
3	Build local capacity and establish operational management functions for community-based MPAs.	3.1	Developed SOP's for community based surveillance and law enforcement.	The SOPs of community surveillance have been finalized and tested during September-December 2017.
3	Build local capacity and establish operational management functions for community-based MPAs.	3.2	Report on surveillance and law enforcement trainings at 10 villages.	Report have been uploaded to grant writer.
3	Build local capacity and establish	3.3	Deployed CB-MPA boundary markers and	CB-MPA boundary markers have been deployed for 10 CB-MPAs.

	operational management functions for community-based MPAs.		signs at 5 villages in North Minahasa.	
3	Build local capacity and establish operational management functions for community-based MPAs.	3.4	Report on awareness events at 10 villages.	The awareness events under this project is divided into awareness for village communities, and specific environmental education activities for elementary schools. Under this project we do not specifically develop the awareness for village communities. The awareness events for local communities were done through involvement in a series of MPA planning process events, dissemination of ecological survey results, and dissemination of the legal status of CB-MPAs. Specific environmental education was designed for students from 4 elementary schools in North Minahasa (SD Negeri Tambun, SD Negeri Tarabitan, SD Negeri Tanah Putih and SD Impres Pulisan). The outcome from the environmental education activities has been quite impressive, where the average test score of the students' knowledge on environmental issues increased from an average of 39.2 (before the environmental program began running) to an average of 81 (at the end of the CEPF project). A report of the awareness and education activities is submitted in this final completion period.
4	Build the capacity of local NGOs.	4.1	Report on formal training activities, including names of NGO staff and positions within NGOs, subject of training, and subsequent analysis of the effectiveness of the training in relation to the host NGOs.	No update. Already finished and reported in the previous progress report.
4	Build the capacity of local NGOs.	4.2	Report on-the-job training activities,	Report of on-job training for the local NGOs has been finalized and submitted through grant writer.

			including names of NGO staff and positions within NGOs, subject of training, and subsequent analysis of the effectiveness of the training in relation to the host NGOs.	
5	Apply CEPF social safeguard on restriction on access to resources.	5.1	Semi-annual reports on implementation of Process Framework	The report has been submitted through grant writer.
6	Manage sub-grants	6.1	Sub-grant agreement between WCS and Manengkel Solidaritas.	Sub-grant agreement with Manengkel Solidaritas was finished in December 2017. The second term of the sub-grant agreement document of Manengkel Solidaritas has been submitted through grant writer.
6	Manage sub-grants	6.2	Annual and final financial and technical reports on Manengkel Solidaritas sub-grant.	Reports from Manengkel Solidaritas have been submitted to WCS, reviewed, and approved.
6	Manage sub-grants	6.3	Sub-grant agreement between WCS and Rumah Ganesa.	Sub-grant agreement with Rumah Ganeca have been finished by December 2017. The second term of sub-grant agreement document of Rumah Ganesa have been submitted through grant writer.
6	Manage sub-grants	6.4	Annual and final financial and technical reports on Rumah Ganesa sub-grant.	Reports from Rumah Ganeca have been submitted to WCS, reviewed, and approved.

Please describe and submit any tools, products, or methodologies that resulted from this project or contributed to the results.

This project has developed Standar Operating Prochedures (SOP) for community based survillance that have been implemented in the 10 targeted CB-MPAs in North Minahasa and Sitaro.

Lessons Learned

Describe any lessons learned during the design and implementation of the project, as well as any related to organizational development and capacity building.

Consider lessons that would inform:

- Project Design Process (*aspects of the project design that contributed to its success/shortcomings*)
- Project Implementation (*aspects of the project execution that contributed to its success/shortcomings*)
- Describe any other lessons learned relevant to the conservation community

Key lessons learned from asisting communities in 10 villages to establish CB-MPAs are:

- **Decisiocn makin process in communities should also involving various community representatives such as community leaders, village authorities, religious leaders, community institutions to come up with solid decisions.**
- **Community-based MPA surveillance requires involvement from various local community members, both directly or indiretly to gain larger coverage and impact. In addition, involving other parties such as government and law enforcement institutions in patrolling the MPAs will strengthen the impact and also to make sure proper law enforcements actions.**
- **Socialization of the CB-MPA status and regulations should also be done through communications with adjacent villages and supported by information media such as information boards and posters.**

Sustainability / Replication

Summarize the success or challenges in ensuring the project will be sustained or replicated, including any unplanned activities that are likely to result in increased sustainability or replicability.

In general, all the planned activities for the two years project have been achieved. By December 2017, we have finalized: (i) the improvement, development, and legalization of CB-MPA management plans at 10 targeted villages in North Minahasa (Desa Lihunu, Tambun, Tarabitan, Pulisan dan Tanah Putih) and Sitaro (Makalehi induk, Makalehi Timur, Tapile, Motole dan Mohongsawang); (ii) Finalized and disseminated the Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) of community based surveillance for the 10 targeted CB-MPAs. As part of the project outputs, we also facilitated the deployment of mooring-buoys for MPA boundaries for 10 targeted CB-MPAs in North Minahasa and Sitaro.



During the period of September to December 2017, the CB-MPA management units had been implementing the SOP of community surveillance. Series of FGD for evaluation of community surveillance were conducted in November 2017 at the 10 villages. In general the communities of the 5 MPAs in North Minahasa had been implementing the SOPs quite intensively. Some violations have been reported (bom fishing) and given information about the regulation of MPAs for entry violations in Tarabitan, Tanah Putih, and Pulisan. From the 4-5 months of implementing community surveillance, no violations have been found in Lihunu and Tambun Villages. The community surveillance of 5 MPAs in Sitaro Districts were not very effective due to limited facilities (i.e. patrol boat, binoculars, communication device) and budget for boat fuel. The next key step to strengthen the community surveillance will be bridging communication with provincial government to see the possibilities funding allocation from provincial budget for facilities and operational.

On-job training for local NGO staffs from Manengkel Solidaritas and Rumah Ganesha runs well. During the implementation of this project we have been involving 2 staffs from each NGO. Each NGO staff work together with WCS staffs and directly involved in the project activities in the field. The on-job training focuses on improving the NGO staffs capacities in terms of: (i) communication with communities and facilitation techniques of community meetings, (ii) understanding of community-based marine protection (community based MPA), (iii) MPA management planning process, (iv) development of SOP for community based MPA surveillance and enforcement, and v) understanding of existing marine and coastal management issues in North Sulawesi. The financing for the NGO staffs on-job training is done through sub-grant mechanism with the NGOs (Manengkel Solidaritas and Rumah Ganesa). The reports of on-job trainings from the two NGOs have been submitted and approved by WCS.

Safeguards

If not listed as a separate Project Component and described above, summarize the implementation of any required action related to social, environmental, or pest management safeguards

This project's goal is to strengthen the community based marine protected area management in 10 villages in North Sulawesi, hence this project has no environmental safeguard issues. Protection effort of marine resources through area closures (marine p rotected area) has potential disruption to social safeguard. By far, during the 18 months of project implementation we focused on planning and capacity building process to strengthen village and community capacity to manage their MPAs. In addition, the MPA enforcement protocol in the SOP emphasize persuasive and communication approach to MPA boundary violator, instead of repressive approach. However, repressive approach will still be applied by law enforcement authorities to destructive fishers.

Additional Comments/Recommendations

Use this space to provide any further comments or recommendations in relation to your project or CEPF

We are expecting continued support for the 10 CB-MPAs to strengthen their capacity in implementing community-based MPA surveillance through providing supporting device/equipment such as communication device, binocular, patrol boat, MPA information boards, as well as socialization of the status of CB-MPAs and regulations to adjacent villages.

Additional Funding

Provide details of any additional funding that supported this project and any funding secured for the project, organization, or the region, as a result of CEPF investment

Total additional funding (US\$)

\$11,552.00

Type of funding

Please provide a breakdown of additional funding (counterpart funding and in-kind) by source, categorizing each contribution into one of the following categories:

- A Project Co-Financing (other donors or your organization contribute to the direct costs of this project)*
- B Grantee and Partner Leveraging (other donors contribute to your organization or a partner organization as a direct result of successes with this CEPF funded project)*
- C Regional/Portfolio Leveraging (other donors make large investments in a region because of CEPF investment or successes related to this project)*

Type of funding:

A. Project Co-Financing: WCS MPA Fund = \$USD 11,552

B. N/A

C. N/A

Information Sharing and CEPF Policy

CEPF is committed to transparent operations and to helping civil society groups share experiences, lessons learned, and results. Final project completion reports are made available on our Web site, www.cepf.net, and publicized in our newsletter and other communications.

1. Please include your full contact details (Name, Organization, Mailing address, Telephone number, E-mail address) below

Yudi Herdiana. Wildlife Conservation Society, Jl. Tampomas No. 35, Bogor 16151. Tel: +62 251 8342135. Email: yherdiana@wcs.org