

# **CEPF Final Completion and Impact Report**

| Organization's Legal Name:<br>Project Title:<br>Grant Number:<br>Hotspot:<br>Strategic Direction: | International Fund for Animal Welfare - China<br>Counter Wildlife Crime in China's Southwest<br>Border Region<br>CEPF-111897<br>Indo-Burma III<br>2 Mitigate zoonotic disease risks by reducing<br>illegal trade and consumption of and threats to<br>wildlife |
|---|--|
| Grant Amount:   | \$224,969.15   |
| Project Dates:  | July 01, 2021 - December 31, 2023  |
| Date of Report:   | February 29, 2024  |

# **IMPLEMENTATION PARTNERS**

#### 1. iConserve

As a subgrantee of IFAW under the project, iConserve and IFAW worked together in providing capacity building support to volunteers and CSOs. We jointly developed training curriculum based on a survey conducted by iConserve with over 50 staff from CSOs in the Counter Wildlife Trafficking (CWT) community. After the training, we also jointly led four groups of trainees in conducting their own research.

#### 2. China Wildlife Conservation Association (CWCA)

IFAW worked closely with CWCA in mobilizing cross-sector effort to enhance practice of logistics industry in tackling illegal wildlife trade. IFAW supported CWCA in hosting a meeting summoned by the National Forestry and Grassland Administration (NFGA) with all relevant regulatory bodies of the logistics industry attending to discuss about cross-sector effort. IFAW and CWCA also jointly developed the educational materials including two short videos and one manual targeting logistics companies.

In addition, IFAW and CWCA jointly launched the Wildlife-free Traveler campaign targeting travelers from China to southeast Asian countries to educate travelers not purchasing illegal wildlife products and bringing back to China.

#### 3. China Express Association (CEA)

Together with CWCA, CEA co-sponsored the educational materials targeting logistics industry. CEA will continue to be engaged in the promotion of the materials after the project.

4. Institute of Psychology of Chinese Academy of Science (IoP)

IoP contributed to the design of the behavior change campaign materials featuring "Face" as a significant influencing factor. IoP hosted a concept development workshop inviting experts

from various fields to discuss about campaign design and was consulted at various stages during the development of the campaign.

5. Cainiao

IFAW and Cainiao jointly planned and implemented an online and offline integrated campaign in Guangxi and Yunnan advocating for not consuming or shipping illegal wildlife products.

# **CONSERVATION IMPACTS**

Planned Long-Term Impacts: 3+ years (as stated in the approved proposal)

| Impact Description   | Impact Summary  |
|--|---|
| By 2025, a Coalition of logistics companies<br>similar to the Coalition to End Wildlife<br>Trafficking Online established with at least<br>80% of the major logistics companies<br>operating in China adopting a zero tolerance<br>policy against wildlife trafficking.      | IFAW has been actively engaging with United for<br>Wildlife to launch a Chapter in China in 2024. The<br>China Chapter aims to bringing together major<br>logistics companies in China to strengthen jointly<br>commitment in combating wildlife crime in China<br>and globally. IFAW and United for Wildlife met in<br>China in November 2023 to discuss about the<br>collaboration and have been engaged in continuous<br>conversation.   |
| In 2026, the CSO organizations mobilized by<br>the project to conduct monitoring of wildlife<br>trade online continue their contribution<br>towards enhancing platform regulation and<br>intelligence-led enforcement actions.   | IFAW maintains communication with several of the<br>volunteers trained during the Iceberg Action<br>Program and continues to work with iConserve to<br>engage volunteers as civil cyber patrollers for<br>combating illegal wildlife trade online. In November<br>2023, IFAW supported one of the trainees from<br>Friends of Nature to prepare for a public interest<br>litigation against one major online platform in China<br>for offering venue to trade illegal hunting<br>equipment. IFAW provided previous findings<br>including major types of equipment and code word<br>used to avoid detection to the trainee and her<br>engagement with an expert in the field who IFAW<br>also invited to provide training to IAP trainees. This<br>kind of support to volunteers and CSOs will continue<br>after the CEPF-funded project ends. |
| In 2025, the target audiences in the border<br>region continue to have upshift in Knowledge,<br>Attitudes and Practice in their behavior change<br>journey to reject the consumption and trade of<br>wildlife parts and products, compared with the<br>project endline data. | Targeted behavior change initiatives remain to be<br>IFAW's priority after the project ends. In addition to<br>products of flagship species including elephant ivory,<br>rhino horn, pangolin scale and tiger products, IFAW<br>has also been following the latest trend in illegal<br>trade of endangered wildlife as exotic pets. In<br>addition to conducting own consumer research,<br>IFAW has also been communicating with Wildlife<br>Conservation Society China to incorporate their<br>consumer research jointly conducted with SUN YAT-<br>SEN University focusing on elephant skin, tiger bone<br>and fresh-water turtles. IFAW will continue to   |

| Impact Description | Impact Summary   |  |
|--------------------|--|--|
|                    | monitor the change in target consumer's change in KAP in wildlife consumption in the coming years. |  |

Planned Short-Term Impacts: 1 to 3 years (as stated in the approved proposal)

| Impact Description   | Impact Summary  |
|--|---|
| At least three major logistics companies in<br>Guangxi and Yunnan incorporate wildlife<br>protection related laws and regulation into<br>their company policies and require mandatory<br>training for staff by the end of the project.   | IFAW and Cainiao, one of the largest logistics<br>service providers in China, jointly launched online<br>and offline campaign advocating for not shipping<br>illegal wildlife products. Cainiao has incorporated the<br>content related to counter wildlife trafficking into<br>their trainings to staff.<br>The Manual for Logistics Companies on Regulation of<br>Illegal Wildlife Products and the two campaign<br>videos were distributed in January 2024 to Yunnan<br>Postal Bureau, Guangxi Postal Bureau, China Post<br>Guangxi Branch, and Deppon Express Yunnan<br>Branch. IFAW will follow up with the companies by<br>end of March 2024 to understand how these<br>materials have been used. IFAW, together with<br>CWCA, jointly created a mini-site for the Say NO to<br>illegal shipping campaign. IFAW and CWCA planned<br>to co-launch this mini-site together with China<br>Express Association (CEA). However, because of<br>staff change within CEA, the launch of the campaign<br>mini-site has to be postponed to April 2024 the<br>earliest.  |
| At least six Chinese domestic CSOs or<br>volunteer groups demonstrate improved<br>knowledge and capacity in conducting illegal<br>wildlife trade monitoring or implementing<br>wildlife conservation campaigns. Result is<br>based on evaluation after workshops jointly<br>provided by IFAW and domestic NGO partners<br>by the end of the project. | Iceberg Action Program (IAP) was launched in<br>December 2021 by iConserve with technical<br>guidance from IFAW. The IAP is composed of three<br>period i.e. baseline research and recruitment, need<br>based training development and implementation,<br>and guided participant-driven research and program<br>evaluation. The evaluation of the training program<br>reviews that over 92% of the 29 participants who<br>completed all the trainings have improved<br>understanding of current situation of illegal wildlife<br>trade after the training workshops. Four research<br>groups of 14 participants were formed to conduct<br>their own research. IFAW and iConserve reviewed<br>each of the research plan and provided detailed<br>comments. Over a period of 4 months from February<br>to May 2023, each of the four research groups<br>successfully achieved their objectives and generated<br>valuable outputs. After a final presentation<br>workshop in May 2023, a program report has been<br>developed by iConserve and IFAW highlighting the<br>four research case studies completed by 14 IAP<br>participants. In addition, iConserve and IFAW co-led<br>the participants in conducting a social media<br>patrolling research in end of December 2022 which |

| Impact Description   | Impact Summary   |
|--|--|
| •  | found 242 videos from 227 accounts containing content related to illegal wildlife trade.   |
| Chinese law enforcement agencies undertake<br>at least five law enforcement investigations<br>based on intelligence gathered from volunteer-<br>driven online monitoring by the end of the<br>project.   | Based on IFAW's analysis, none of the information<br>collected from volunteer's online monitoring has<br>intelligence value. This reflects the general trend<br>that online illegal wildlife trade in IFAW has<br>significantly decreased after China implementing the<br>Ivory Ban. Large scale trade can hardly be found on<br>open internet platforms. IFAW shared the postings<br>identified by the volunteers with platforms for them<br>to delete and strengthen platform regulation. This<br>general trend and the fact that this impact would<br>not be achieved was communicated with CEPF in<br>February 2023. |
| At least two Chinese internet companies apply<br>innovative technology to support changing<br>consumer behavior to reduce wildlife trade, by<br>the end of the project.  | Short video social media platform Douyin (Chinese TikTok) and video platform IQiyi were utilized for target promotion of campaign message.   |
|  | The Face campaign was promoted from July to<br>November 2022 on Douyin. Douyin' features allow<br>the campaign to differentiate target consumers<br>based on their detailed demographic characteristics<br>and online behavior on Douyin. The campaign<br>targets current and potential wildlife consumers in<br>Yunnan and Guangxi province who buy or desire to<br>buy elephant ivory and tiger parts and products for<br>face consumption.  |
|  | From March 25 to April 21, campaign print PSA and<br>30-second video were displayed through digital<br>channels including IQiyi video website and multiple<br>travel, lifestyle and news mobile applications. Users<br>who searched information related to traveling<br>abroad to purchase wildlife products on Baidu were<br>tagged as high-risk potential consumers. When<br>these users go to Baidu-owned platform iQiyi to<br>watch video, they will be exposed to the campaign<br>videos.   |
| At least 50% of the target audience exposed to<br>IFAW's behavior change campaigns<br>demonstrate an upshift in Knowledge,<br>Attitudes and Practice in rejection of wildlife<br>consumption based on pre and post campaign<br>online surveys by the end of the project. | <ul> <li>Key impacts of the Face campaign based on<br/>evaluation conducted by a survey agency include:</li> <li>Percentage of respondents who are aware of<br/>personal penalty increased by 50%;</li> <li>Percentage of respondents who agree wildlife<br/>products show social status and financial capability<br/>decreased by 45%;</li> <li>Percentage of respondents who agree wildlife<br/>consumption is cruel and bloody increased by 65%;</li> <li>Purchase intention of respondents decreased by</li> </ul>   |

# Unexpected impacts (positive or negative)?

One positive unexpected impact out of the project is follow up action taken by that one of the trainees of the Iceberg Action Program who is from a Chinese domestic CSO named Friend of Nature which focuses on environment-related public interest litigation. After attending the training and the follow up research, the trainee became interested in the issue of selling hunting tools on internet platforms. In November 2023, the trainee reached out to IFAW to help her prepare a public interest litigation case against one of the biggest E-commerce platforms. With IFAW's support, the trainee applied the learnings from the Iceberg Action Program to map out the scale of the problem on the platform. IFAW also facilitated conversation between the trainee and relevant experts in the field. The case is currently still under preparation.

# **PROJECT RESULTS/DELIVERABLES**

### **Overall results of the project:**

The project focuses on three strategic areas: enhancing capacity of CSOs in tackling illegal wildlife products, changing consumer behavior in Guangxi and Yunnan, and enhancing practice of logistics industry by educating management level and frontline staff of key logistics companies.

1. Enhancing capacity of CSOs in tackling illegal wildlife products - Iceberg Action Program (IAP)

The initiative to build capacity of CSOs to tackle wildlife crime named Iceberg Action Program was completed in June 2023. Iceberg Action Program (IAP) was launched in December 2021 by iConserve with technical guidance from IFAW. The IAP is composed of three period i.e. baseline research and recruitment, need based training development and implementation, and guided participant-driven research and program evaluation. The evaluation of the training program reveals that over 92% of the 29 participants who completed IAP trainings have improved knowledge in combating illegal wildlife trade after the training workshops.

After receiving trainings, four research groups were formed to conduct their own research. IFAW and iConserve reviewed each of the research plan and provided detailed comments. Over a period of four months from February to May 2023, each of the four research groups successfully achieved their objectives and generated valuable outputs. After a final presentation workshop in May 2023, a program report has been developed by iConserve and IFAW highlighting the four research case studies completed by 14 IAP participants along with an identification manual for commonly traded birds in local bird market developed by one of the research groups.

After the joint training program with iConserve, IFAW and iConserve also identified ten volunteers and initiated a one-month volunteer driven social media monitoring research from November to December 2022 targeting three short video platforms including Bilibili, Douyin and Kuaishou. The research found 242 videos from 227 accounts containing content related to illegal wildlife trade. These accounts have over 10 million followers. The result from the research was released by iConserve in May 2023.

2. Changing consumer behavior in Guangxi and Yunnan - Face campaign and Wildlife-Free Traveler campaign

#### 2.1 Face Campaign

From 2019 to 2021, IFAW partnered with the Institute of Psychology of Chinese Academy of Sciences (IoP) to apply behavioral psychology theories and techniques in conducting consumer research and developing targeted behavioral interventions. Based on literature review and in-laboratory experiment, the joint research identifies and analyzes thirteen factors influencing wildlife consumption behavior. As the only shared key influencing factor

driving both hedonic and utilitarian wildlife consumption, "face" was identified to be used to develop a pilot behavior change campaign under the project.

The campaign aims to reduce the consumption of elephant ivory and tiger bone driven by face consumption. It also aims to reduce the social acceptance of wildlife products by weakening its perceived value in social interactions. The campaign targets current and potential wildlife consumers in Yunnan and Guangxi province who buy or desire to buy elephant ivory and tiger parts and products for face consumption. The target audience are between 30 and 50 years old and with middle-higher income level.

After implemented the campaign in two phases from July to November 2022, getting 11.36 million impressions and generating 131,802 interactions, the final evaluation of the campaign was conducted in December 2022. The evaluation focused on how did the campaign change target consumers' Knowledge, Attitude and Practice (KAP) in consumption of target species. The results are summarized as below:

Percentage of respondents who are aware of personal penalty increased by 50%;
Percentage of respondents who agree wildlife products show social status and financial capability decreased by 45%;

•Percentage of respondents who agree wildlife consumption is cruel and bloody increased by 65%;

•Purchase intention of respondents decreased by 52%;

#### 2.2 Wildlife Free Traveler Campaign

After China re-opened its border in 2023, IFAW launched the digital promotion of China Wildlife Free Traveler Campaign with CEPF funding to deter outbound travelers from purchasing of ivory and other illegal wildlife products abroad and carrying or mailing these products back into China. From March 25 to April 21, campaign print PSA and 30-second video were displayed through digital channels including IQiyi video website and multiple travel, lifestyle and news mobile applications. Target audience was selected based on their demographic and/or behavioral characteristics on these platforms. A Campaign site including an online mini-survey was launched together to allow engagement with the target audience and gathering feedback on their attitudes and future intention towards wildlife consumption. The campaign attracted 1,208,206 views, and the campaign mini-site had 33,049 unique visits during promotion time. Among the 395 respondents to the survey on the campaign mini-site, 73% of the respondents are from campaign target geographic location which are Guangxi and Yunnan. 93% responded that after seeing campaign material they have no intention to buy or consume wildlife products in future. The Wildlife Free Traveler (WFT) campaign's offline promotion was implemented in the southeast region of China from September 26, 2023 for a month. The campaign PSA was promoted on China-Laos train, bus stops in Dongxing, Guangxi, and railway station in Xishuangbanna, Yunnan. Covering the entire National Day Holiday, the promotion gained more than 2 million views among campaign target audiences and leveraged more than 80,000 USD in in-kind support.

#### 3. Enhancing practice of logistics industry

IFAW, together with CWCA and China Express Association (CEA), jointly created two short videos targeting frontline staff and management team of logistics companies. Using entertaining animation, the videos introduce relevant laws and regulations and commonly shipped wildlife products and disguising techniques, and call on staff of logistics companies to refrain from illegal shipping of wildlife products. The videos were uploaded to a mini-site for the Say NO to Illegal Shipping Wildlife campaign. The mini-site allows participants to watch the two videos of the campaign and then sign and share a personal commitment, and it can be easily shared via Wechat to all the frontline staff of logistics companies. IFAW and CWCA will co-launch this mini-site together with CEA. The launch of the campaign mini-site has to be postponed to April 2024 due to staff change within CEA.

The electronic copies of the two videos were shared with customs representatives of over 12 countries in Asia during the Operation Mekong Dragon V Debrief organized by Viet Nam Customs at Hanoi in November 2023.

The Manual for Logistics Companies on Regulation of Illegal Wildlife Products was updated incorporating the latest policy update in January 2024 and distributed to Yunnan Postal Bureau, Guangxi Postal Bureau, China Post Guangxi Branch and Deppon Express Yunnan Branch.

IFAW also collaborated with Cainiao on an integrated campaign in Guangxi and Yunnan advocating for young people not engaging in wildlife crime. The campaign gained 830,000 views on the Cainiao application opening page and was delivered through 700,000 package receipts. The offline campaign at Guangxi International Business Vocational College attracted participation of over 853 students with 597 students signing a pledge for saying NO to illegal wildlife trade.

# **Results for each deliverable:**

| Com | ponent  | Delive | erable   |   |
|-----|---|--------|--|---|
| #   | Description   | #      | Description  | Results for Deliverable   |
| 1.0 | Mobilize the logistics and<br>transport industry to<br>strengthen their company<br>policies and raise staff<br>awareness to reduce illegal<br>wildlife market accessibility                               | 1.1    | Educational materials for<br>ground staff of logistics<br>companies such as short<br>videos and comics | Educational materials created including two<br>short videos, one campaign mini-site and one<br>manual.  |
| 1.0 | Mobilize the logistics and<br>transport industry to<br>strengthen their company<br>policies and raise staff<br>awareness to reduce illegal<br>wildlife market accessibility                               | 1.2    | Manual for Logistics<br>Companies on Regulation of<br>Illegal Wildlife Products                        | The Manual was updated twice in November<br>2023 and then in January 2024. On January<br>4th, the Ministry of Transport issued the<br>Measures for the Management of the Express<br>Delivery Industry which will come into force<br>on March 1st 2024. The Manual was updated<br>based on the latest notice before produced<br>and distributed. |
| 2.0 | Change wildlife consumer<br>behavior by applying<br>behavior psychology<br>insights in interventions<br>and reaching target<br>audience through engaging<br>private sector and<br>leveraging e-technology | 2.1    | Communications materials of<br>interventions designed<br>applying psychographic<br>insights            | The communications materials include two<br>short videos which were jointly developed with<br>Institute of Psychology of Chinese Academy of<br>Science with insights from experts from<br>various fields incorporated.  |
| 2.0 | Change wildlife consumer<br>behavior by applying<br>behavior psychology<br>insights in interventions<br>and reaching target<br>audience through engaging  | 2.2    | Campaign evaluation report   | Completed and submitted in the January to June 2023 Progress Report.  |

| Component D |  |                                       | erable   |  |  |
|-------------|--|---------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| #           | Description  | # Description Results for Deliverable |  |  |  |
|             | private sector and<br>leveraging e-technology  |                                       |  |  |  |
| 2.0         | Change wildlife consumer<br>behavior by applying<br>behavior psychology<br>insights in interventions<br>and reaching target<br>audience through engaging<br>private sector and<br>leveraging e-technology  | 2.3                                   | Campaign summary report<br>including communications<br>materials                                   | Shared in report and at the Mid-term<br>Workshop with other grantees.    |  |
| 3.0         | Subgrant to Shenzhen<br>iConserve Eco-Technology<br>for enhancing civil society<br>engagement in combating<br>online wildlife crime by<br>providing capacity building<br>support and facilitating<br>information exchange with<br>enforcement agencies and<br>internet platforms | 3.1                                   | Signed sub-grant contract<br>(with CEPF flowdown<br>provisions)                                    | Signed and submitted.  |  |
| 3.0         | Subgrant to Shenzhen<br>iConserve Eco-Technology<br>for enhancing civil society<br>engagement in combating<br>online wildlife crime by<br>providing capacity building<br>support and facilitating<br>information exchange with<br>enforcement agencies and<br>internet platforms | 3.2                                   | Result of survey on current<br>situation of engagement of<br>Chinese domestic CSOs on<br>IWT topic | Completed and submitted in the July to<br>December 2022 Progress Report. |  |

| Com | Component Deliverable  |     |  |  |
|-----|--|-----|--|--|
| #   | Description  | #   | Description  | Results for Deliverable  |
| 3.0 | Subgrant to Shenzhen<br>iConserve Eco-Technology<br>for enhancing civil society<br>engagement in combating<br>online wildlife crime by<br>providing capacity building<br>support and facilitating<br>information exchange with<br>enforcement agencies and<br>internet platforms | 3.3 | Evaluation report for<br>workshops for domestic<br>CSOs and volunteer groups | Completed and submitted in the July to<br>December 2022 Progress Report. |
| 3.0 | Subgrant to Shenzhen<br>iConserve Eco-Technology<br>for enhancing civil society<br>engagement in combating<br>online wildlife crime by<br>providing capacity building<br>support and facilitating<br>information exchange with<br>enforcement agencies and<br>internet platforms | 3.4 | Report of volunteer-led<br>social media monitoring<br>research               | Submitted in the January to June Progress<br>Report.                     |
| 3.0 | Subgrant to Shenzhen<br>iConserve Eco-Technology<br>for enhancing civil society<br>engagement in combating<br>online wildlife crime by<br>providing capacity building<br>support and facilitating<br>information exchange with<br>enforcement agencies and<br>internet platforms | 3.5 | Summary of intelligence<br>briefs and information<br>exchanges               | Not completed due to lack to intelligence<br>leads.                      |

| Com | Component Deliverable  |     |  |  |  |
|-----|--|-----|--|--|--|
| #   | Description  | #   | Description  | Results for Deliverable  |  |
| 4.0 | Subgrant to<br>Xishuangbanna Tropical<br>Rainforest Conservation<br>Foundation for enhancing<br>civil society engagement<br>by providing capacity<br>building support and<br>facilitating information<br>exchange with<br>enforcement agencies and<br>internet platforms   | 4.1 | Signed sub-grant contract<br>(with CEPF flowdown<br>provisions)  | The second grant was canceled and implemented by IFAW directly.  |  |
| 5.0 | Involve stakeholders,<br>including project-affected<br>groups, government<br>agencies, and local civil<br>society organizations, as<br>early as possible in the<br>design process and ensure<br>that their views and<br>concerns are made known<br>and taken into account. | 5.1 | Summary of compliance with<br>CEPF's Stakeholder<br>Engagement Best Practice<br>monitored and reported to<br>CEPF. | IFAW has been compliant to CEPF's<br>Stakeholder Engagement Best Practice but no<br>formal report was submitted. |  |
| 4.0 | Subgrant to<br>Xishuangbanna Tropical<br>Rainforest Conservation<br>Foundation for enhancing<br>civil society engagement<br>by providing capacity<br>building support and<br>facilitating information<br>exchange with   | 4.2 | Evaluation report for<br>workshops for domestic<br>CSOs and volunteer groups                                       | The second grant was canceled and implemented by IFAW directly.  |  |

| Com | ponent   | Deliv | Deliverable  |   |  |
|-----|--|-------|--|---|--|
| #   | Description  | #     | Description  | Results for Deliverable   |  |
|     | enforcement agencies and internet platforms  |       |  |   |  |
| 4.0 | Subgrant to<br>Xishuangbanna Tropical<br>Rainforest Conservation<br>Foundation for enhancing<br>civil society engagement<br>by providing capacity<br>building support and<br>facilitating information<br>exchange with<br>enforcement agencies and<br>internet platforms | 4.3   | Summary of intelligence<br>briefs and information<br>exchanges | The second grant was canceled and implemented by IFAW directly. |  |

#### Tools, products or methodologies that resulted from the project or contributed to the results:

1. Two animated short videos for staff of logistics companies - Two entertaining short videos were created to enhance the knowledge of awareness of staff of logistics companies. The first video targeting management level of the companies emphasizes on relevant laws and policies and legal consequences for logistics services engaging in wildlife crime. The second video targeting frontline staff of the companies emphasizes on personal legal risks for couriers engaging in wildlife crime and commonly traded wildlife products and disguise methods. English subtitle has been added to the two videos.

2. The Manual for Logistics Companies on Regulation of Illegal Wildlife Products - The Manual has incorporated the latest policy update in January 2024. It gives a comprehensive introduction of the laws and regulation on shipping wildlife products in China, commonly shipped illegal wildlife products and typical criminal cases involving shipping illegal wildlife products.

3. Two videos for the Face campaign - The two videos developed for promotion on Douyin featured two typical scenarios in daily life when people consume wildlife products driven by face consumption. The storyline and intervention messaging were developed based on IFAW's joint research with Institute of Psychology of Chinese Academy of Science (IoP) and result from pre-test using in-depth interview and focus group discussion with consumers.

4. Face campaign evaluation report - The report introduces in detail the methodology of how IFAW developed a targeted behavior change campaign from researching on psychological drivers for wildlife consumption to developing campaign concept and conducting campaign promotion evaluation.

5. Case Study Report of Iceberg Action Program (IAP) - The report includes the overall methodology of the CSO capacity building program, key findings from the pre-training survey, case studies of after-training pilot research projects carried out by trainees, and lessons learned. The report provides a good reference for future CSO capacity building programs.

# **PORTFOLIO INDICATORS**

| Portfolio<br>Indicator<br>Number | Portfolio<br>Indicator<br>Description   | Expected<br>Numerical<br>Contribution | Expected<br>Contribution<br>Description   | Actual<br>Numerical<br>Contribution | Actual Contribution<br>Description  |
|----------------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|-------------------------------------|---|
| 1                                | Number of civil<br>society<br>organizations,<br>including domestic<br>organizations, that<br>actively participate<br>in conservation<br>actions guided by<br>the ecosystem<br>profile.                    | 6                                     | IFAW will provide<br>sub-grants to two<br>domestic partners to<br>provide capacity<br>building training<br>workshops for<br>domestic CSOs and<br>volunteer groups with<br>particular focus on<br>those based in<br>Guangxi and Yunnan<br>and conduct<br>evaluation of their<br>improvement. | 2                                   | Only one out of the 29<br>volunteers who completed<br>trainings of IAP came from<br>a CSO. iConserve itself is a<br>CSO whose capacity in<br>engaging volunteers had<br>been enhanced by<br>implementing IAP. In the<br>current environment in<br>China, the number of CSOs<br>engaging in counter wildlife<br>trafficking effort is very<br>limited. |
| 2.2                              | Number of initiatives<br>to reduce<br>transportation, sale<br>and consumption of<br>wildlife piloted in<br>collaboration with<br>enforcement<br>agencies and/or<br>actors in the public<br>health sector. | 1                                     | Engage with relevant<br>regulatory bodies of<br>logistics companies to<br>produce series of<br>educational materials<br>for management level<br>and ground staff of<br>major logistics<br>companies operating<br>in Guangxi and<br>Yunnan.  | 1                                   |   |

| Portfolio<br>Indicator<br>Number | Portfolio<br>Indicator<br>Description  | Expected<br>Numerical<br>Contribution | Expected<br>Contribution<br>Description  | Actual<br>Numerical<br>Contribution | Actual Contribution<br>Description   |
|----------------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| 2.3                              | Number of private<br>and/or state-owned<br>companies introduce<br>effective measures<br>to reduce their<br>involvement in the<br>transportation, sale<br>and consumption of<br>wildlife. | 3                                     | At least three major<br>logistics companies in<br>Guangxi and Yunnan<br>border region<br>incorporate wildlife<br>protection related<br>laws and regulation<br>into their company<br>policies and require<br>mandatory training<br>for staff by the end of<br>the project | 1                                   | Cainiao has incorporated<br>wildlife protection related<br>laws and regulation into<br>their company policies and<br>require mandatory training<br>for staff. The campaign<br>materials were also<br>promoted to Yunnan Postal<br>Bureau, Guangxi Postal<br>Bureau, Guangxi Postal<br>Bureau, China Post Guangxi<br>Branch, and Deppon<br>Express Yunnan Branch,<br>however commitment from<br>these companies has not<br>been secured. Due to delay<br>in jointly launching the<br>campaign with China<br>Express Association and<br>CWCA, the promotion of<br>campaign content to wider<br>companies will be delayed<br>to April 2024. |
| 2.4                              | Number of<br>campaigns<br>implemented to<br>reduce consumer<br>demand for wildlife<br>and mobilize public<br>participation in<br>wildlife crime<br>detection and<br>reporting.           | 3                                     | Two online<br>campaigns will be<br>conducted jointly<br>with internet<br>company partners<br>and one offline<br>campaign will be<br>conducted jointly<br>with customs via<br>targeted border<br>channels and ports.  | 3                                   | One online campaign was<br>conducted via iQiyi and one<br>online campaign was<br>conducted on Douyin. The<br>offline campaign was also<br>implemented from<br>September 26, 2023 for a<br>month. The campaign PSA<br>was promoted on China-<br>Laos train, bus stops in<br>Dongxing, Guangxi, and<br>railway station in<br>Xishuangbanna, Yunnan.  |

# **GLOBAL INDICATORS**

#### **Protected Areas**

Protected areas that have been created and/or expanded as a result of the project. Protected areas may include private or community reserves, municipal or provincial parks, or other designations where biodiversity conservation is an official management goal.

| Name of Protected<br>Area | WDPA<br>ID* | Latitude | Longitude | Country |  | New<br>Protected<br>Hectares<br>*** | Year of Legal<br>Declaration<br>or Expansion |
|---------------------------|-------------|----------|-----------|---------|--|-------------------------------------|--|
|---------------------------|-------------|----------|-----------|---------|--|-------------------------------------|--|

\*World Database of Protected Areas

\*\*If this is a new protected area, 0 should appear in this column

\*\*\* This column excludes the original total size of the protected area.

### **Key Biodiversity Area Management**

Key Biodiversity Areas (KBAs) under improved management—where tangible results have been achieved to support conservation—as a result of the project.

| KBA Name | KBA<br>Code | Size of<br>KBA | Number of<br>Hectares with |
|----------|-------------|----------------|----------------------------|
|          |             |                | Improved                   |
|          |             |                | Management                 |

### **Production Landscapes**

Production landscapes with strengthened management of biodiversity as a result of the project.

A production landscape is defined as a site outside a protected area where commercial agriculture, forestry or natural product exploitation occurs.

| Name of Latitude<br>Production<br>Landscape | Longitude | Hectares<br>Strengthened | Intervention |
|---|-----------|--------------------------|--------------|
|---|-----------|--------------------------|--------------|

### **Benefits to Individuals**

#### • Structured Training:

| Number of<br>Men Trained | Number of<br>Women Trained | Topics of Training |
|--------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|
|                          |                            |                    |

#### • Cash Benefits:

| Number of Men<br>- Cash Benefits | Description of Benefits |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------|
|                                  |                         |

# **Benefits to Communities**

| View the <b>characteristics</b> column below with the following | View the <b>benefits</b> column below with the following |
|---|--|
| corresponding codes:  | corresponding codes:                                     |
| 1- Small Landowners   | a. Increased Access to Clean Water                       |
| 2- Subsistence Economy  | b. Increased Food Security                               |
| 3- Indigenous/ Ethnic Peoples                                   | c. Increased Access to Energy                            |
| 4- Pastoralists / Nomadic Peoples                               | d. Increased Access to Public Services                   |
| 5- Recent Migrants  | e. Increased Resilience to Climate Change                |
| 6- Urban Communities  | f. Improved Land Tenure                                  |
| 7- Other  | g. Improved Use of Traditional Knowledge                 |
|   | h. Improved Decision-Making                              |
|   | i. Improved Access to Ecosystem Services                 |

| Community<br>Name |   |   |   | nmu<br>Icte |   | - | 5 |   |   | Тур | oe o | of B | en | efit |   |   | Country | Number of<br>Males<br>Benefitting | Females |
|-------------------|---|---|---|-------------|---|---|---|---|---|-----|------|------|----|------|---|---|---------|-----------------------------------|---------|
|                   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4           | 5 | 6 | 7 | а | b | С   | d    | е    | f  | g    | h | i |         | _                                 |         |

**Characteristics of "Other" Communities:** 

# **Policies, Laws and Regulations**

| View the <b>topics</b> column below with the following corresponding codes: |                         |                       |                   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|-------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| A- Agriculture E- Energy I- Planning/Zoning M- Tourism                      |                         |                       |                   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| B- Climate  | F- Fisheries            | J- Pollution          | N- Transportation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| C- Ecosystem Management   | G- Forestry             | K- Protected Areas    | O- Wildlife Trade |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D- Education  | H- Mining and Quarrying | L- Species Protection | P- Other          |  |  |  |  |  |  |

| No. | Name of Law | Scope |   |   |   |   |   |   |   | Тор | oics | 5 |   |   |   |   |   |   |
|-----|-------------|-------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|-----|------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
|     |             |       | Α | В | С | D | Ε | F | G | Η   | Ι    | J | Κ | L | Μ | Ν | 0 | Ρ |

"Other" Topics Addressed by the Policy, Law or Regulation:

| No. | Country/ Countries | Date<br>Enacted/<br>Amended | Expected impact | Action Performed to<br>Achieve the Enactment/<br>Amendment |
|-----|--------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|--|
|-----|--------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|--|

# **Companies Adopting Biodiversity-friendly Practices**

A company is defined as a for-profit business entity. A biodiversity-friendly practice is one that conserves or uses natural resources in a sustainable manner.

| Name of Company | Description of Biodiversity-Friendly Practice | Country/Countries<br>where Practice was |
|-----------------|---|---|
|                 |   | Adopted                                 |

### **Networks and Partnerships**

Networks/partnerships should have some lasting benefit beyond immediate project implementation. Informal networks/partnerships are acceptable.

| Name of             | Year        | Country/  | Established | Purpose |
|---------------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|---------|
| Network/Partnership | Established | Countries | by Project? |         |

### Sustainable Financing

Sustainable financing mechanisms generate funding for the long-term (generally five or more years). These include, but are not limited to, conservation trust funds, debt-for-nature swaps, payment for ecosystem services (PES) schemes, and other revenue, fee or tax schemes that generate long-term funding for conservation.

| Name of<br>Mechanism | Purpose | Date<br>Established | Description | <br>Project<br>Intervention | Delivery<br>of |
|----------------------|---------|---------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------|
|                      |         |                     |             |                             | Funds?         |

## **Globally Threatened Species**

Globally threatened species (CR, EN, VU) on the IUCN Red List of Threatened Species, benefitting from the project.

| Genus | Species | Common Name | Status | Intervention | <b>Population Trend</b> |
|-------|---------|-------------|--------|--------------|-------------------------|
|       |         | (English)   |        |              | at Site                 |

# **LESSONS LEARNED**

1. Having thorough understanding of CSOs before designing capacity building program is important

The original plan of the project is to identify several CSOs and provide capacity building support for them to better engage in counter wildlife crime (CWC) effort. However, after our partner iConserve conducted a survey with more than 40 staff of CSOs, we realized that we have to shift target audience of the capacity building program to volunteers instead of CSOs. First of all, in light of the special social environment in China, the number of CSOs who have the potential to engage in CWC is very limited. Second of all, because CSOs

#### 2. Capacity building support to CSOs needs to go beyond trainings

We originally planned to only provide the training together with iConserve and then select 10 participants to jointly conduct social media monitoring research. However, as we identified volunteers instead of CSOs as our trainees, we realized that unless we support research projects following the trainings for trainees to apply what they learned, most of the trainees won't have an opportunity to use the learnings and the trainings will be soon forgotten. Therefore, after discussion with iConserve, we decided to provide financial and technical support to interested trainees after the trainings for them to implement their own project. 14 out of the 29 trainees formed four groups and conducted their own project. The result has been put together as a research catalogue as an output of Iceberg Action Program. We recommend that for capacity building programs targeting CSOs or communities, organizers should try as much as possible to build-in support for real life practice or projects after the training. Otherwise, learnings from training may not necessarily be translated into actual capacity.

3. Focusing on regulatory bodies instead of individual companies when engaging logistics industry

One strategic focus of the project is to enhance the practice of logistics companies by providing law education to frontline staff of these companies. We were hoping to replicate the success we have in working with internet companies in the logistics industry. However, as we engaged the logistics companies in Guangxi and Yunnan who we established contact with through past projects, we realized that logistics companies are much more difficult to engage compared with internet companies. First, logistics companies don't attach as much importance to illegal wildlife products as they do to other contraband goods such as drugs and weapons. So, unless there is direct pressure from regulatory bodies, there is not enough incentive for them to work with NGOs to identify risk spots and enhance staff capacity. Second, logistics companies generally don't have ESG plan as internet companies. Because their business is mostly impacted by cost and quality of service instead of brand, most of the companies don't have ESG/CSR plan thus do not value the branding benefit from working with NGOs. We were able to engage Cainiao in the project only because such collaboration can be included in Alibaba's overall ESG plan. For markets sharing similarities as China, we recommend focusing on working with regulatory bodies of logistics services instead of individual companies to enhance practice of the industry.

#### 4. Promotion of campaign on social media requires special expertise

Promoting Behavior Change (BC) campaigns on social media is very different from offline promotion when campaigners only need to decide on simple factors such as location and promotional period. Because each social media platform has its own methodology in tagging users and algorithm for promoting content, it is very important to identify a service provider who have comprehensive knowledge of the identified platforms and can fully comprehend the needs for the campaign. IFAW approached four agencies and spent a long time in discussions before selecting the service provider. The provider was not only able to tailor design a promotional strategy that suits our needs but also provided suggestions on our campaign content design to make it more attractive for users on Douyin. Usually when planning a behavior change campaign, people would only consider creative design agencies and evaluation agencies but may not realize promotion service providers are also crucial to ensure campaign impact. We recommend fellow organizations to plan enough time for identifying the right service providers for social media promotion.

5. Qualitative interviews and focus-group discussions are very important for effective Behavior change content development and campaign evaluation During our project, qualitative interviews and focus-group discussions provided very valuable information for our campaign. Although quantitative surveys are important for understanding campaign impact because these surveys are designed by NGOs are research agencies who usually cannot think from the perspective of actual consumers, it is hard to get information beyond what is already known or assumed. During our campaign, through in-depth interviews we realized that the fear of purchasing fake products and thereby losing face in front of friends is a strong deterrent factor to consumption of tiger bone wine. We incorporated this learning into campaign design which resonated strongly as revealed by campaign evaluation. We recommend campaigners to allocate enough resources for qualitative research and pre-test when designing and evaluating their behavior change campaign.

# SUSTAINABILITY/REPLICATION

#### Successes

1. We see a strong need for replicating the CSO capacity building program moving forward with particular focus on combating wildlife cybercrime. IFAW's long term monitoring of illegal wildlife trade online reveals that illegal activities are increasingly shifting to live streaming platforms which are not possible to monitor with code word or image recognitionbased data mining method. It requires a significant amount of human capacity to frequently check content online and analyze user behavior. Considering the situation, it is important to have more CSOs and volunteers engaged in the effort to timely report infringing content and share laws and regulations with other users. In October 2022, IFAW organized an EUfunded workshop in Bangkok focusing on enhancing capacity of CSOs in Great Mekong region and Malaysia to tackle wildlife cybercrime. More than 40 delegates representing 16 domestic and international organizations from Cambodia, Laos, Malaysia, Myanmar, Thailand, Viet Nam and China attended the workshop. During the discussion at the workshop, the participants reached consensus that similar trend in wildlife cybercrime in observed in most of Southeast Asian countries, and it is important to engage more civil participation to tackle this issue. IFAW plans to replicate the success in training CSOs and volunteers under the CEPF project in a new USAID-funded project focusing on key Asian countries in the next five years.

2. IFAW would replicate the success of the Face campaign in future targeted campaigns and share the learnings with broader communities working on behavior change campaigns to reduce wildlife consumption. The CEPF-funded Face campaign is the first campaign for IFAW to apply the findings from the joint research with Institute of Psychology of Chinese Academy of Science in a real-life campaign. Different from past campaigns usually focus on changing behavior in use of certain wildlife products for specific reason such as consuming ivory for antique collection or pangolin scale for medicinal benefit, the Face campaign focuses on key psychological driver behind wildlife consumption, and such approach has the potential to impact wildlife consumption beyond specific use of a particular product. In

Template version: 1 June 2020

IFAW's upcoming social media campaigns focusing on consuming endangered wildlife as pets, the learnings of from the Face campaign will be incorporated into campaign design.

#### Challenges

1. Based on our learning, success engagement of logistics companies in China largely depends on the will of the relevant governmental sector regulating the industry. However, such will is impacted by many factors and cannot be guaranteed with the effort from NGOs. During our project, despite our effort, we were not able to engage the governmental sectors regulating transportation or postal services to participate. We largely relied on China Wildlife Conservation Association to engage China Express Association which has some level of impact power over courier companies but is still not able to mandate actions from these companies. The uncertainties in engaging government may limit the sustainability of the effort to enhance practices of logistics companies.

# **ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SAFEGUARDS/STANDARDS**

# ADDITIONAL COMMENTS/RECOMMENDATIONS

I would recommend CEPF facilitating more opportunities for CSOs to learn from each other and receiving feedback from CEPF. The mid-term workshop in 2022 provided an exceptional opportunity for CSOs to learn from each other and build connection and friendship which would benefit partnership beyond CEPF. It is understood that given resource and environmental concerns, more offline events like this workshop are neither feasible nor ideal. However, I would really appreciate it if CEPF could facilitate more frequent webinars/workshops/roundtable discussions among partners especially those who are working under the same theme and can benefit from timely sharing of learnings. CEPF could request partners to take turns in hosting such virtual events. To not add burden to CSOs who are busy with their daily work, CEPF do not have to make these event mandatory, but can request interested partners to attend voluntarily with CEPF playing an overall coordination role. Partners can each give a 10-minute introduction following a format provided by CEPF to make these sharing and discussions more structured and focused. For instance, each partner can share one major impact, one lesson learned and one opportunity for collaboration or future activities. In addition, such events provide the opportunity for grantees to receive timely feedback from CEPF and adaptively manage project. Currently, feedback from CEPF on project progress and impact is rather limited.

| Total Amount of<br>Additional Funding<br>Actually Secured<br>(USD) | \$170,000.00   |
|--|--|
| Breakdown of<br>Additional Funding                                 | Above \$USD 15,000 - European Commission.<br>Above \$USD 75,000 - IFAW unrestricted fund.<br>Above \$USD 80,000 - in-kind support from media partner for<br>offline promotion. |

## ADDITIONAL FUNDING

# **INFORMATION SHARING AND CEPF POLICY**

CEPF is committed to transparent operations and to helping civil society groups share experiences, lessons learned and results. For more information about this project, you may contact the organization and/or individual listed below.

International Fund for Animal Welfare, MA Chenyue, cma@ifaw.org