

# CEPF FINAL PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

## I. BASIC DATA

**Organization Legal Name:** World Wide Fund for Nature International- Tanzania Programme Office

**Project Title (as stated in the grant agreement):** *Improving the Conservation of Magombera Forest*

**Implementation Partners for this Project:** Kilombero District Council, Kilombero Sugar Company (ILLOVO), Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism, Ministry of Lands, Housing and Human Settlements Developments and the Udzungwa Forest Conservation Project.

**Project Dates (as stated in the grant agreement):** November 1, 2006 - December 31, 2009

**Date of Report (month/year):** March 2010

## II. OPENING REMARKS

***Provide any opening remarks that may assist in the review of this report.***

This report provides an overview of various strategies and efforts made by WWF and partners to improve the conservation of the Magombera Forest. Magombera Forest is part of the Udzungwa ecosystem in the southern end of the Eastern Arc Mountain Range in South-central Tanzania. The forest harbors endemic and endangered species of plants and animals which some of them are not found anywhere else in the world. However, the forest is threatened because of its unclear protected area status and lack of proper management. The canopy of the forest is mostly intact, however limited regeneration and continued forest use threatens the future of the forest. The main threats are currently wood extraction and forest fires which continue to degrade the forest understorey. This has resulted in the rapid invasion by opportunistic species restricting natural species regeneration. With financial support from Critical Ecosystem Partnership Fund (CEPF), WWF-Tanzania Programme Office (WWF-TPO) has been working very closely with various stakeholders including Conservation and Management of Eastern Arc Mountain Forests, GEF/UNDP funded project, Selous Game Reserve, National Land Use Planning Commission, Udzungwa Mountains National Park (UMNP), Udzungwa Ecological Monitoring Center, Illovo Sugar Company, Kilombero district and local communities in Magombera, Kanyenje, Katurukila and Msolwa station to improve conservation of Magombera forest.

Magombera forest was declared a Forest Reserve under the custodian of Forest and Beekeeping Division in 1955. By then, the size of the forest reserve was 15.1sq km and contiguous with forest of the Udzungwa Mountains. However agricultural land clearance over the years reduced the forest size to only around 10 sq. km. This is the last remaining fragment of forest that once spanned most of the Kilombero valley. The construction of the Tanzania -Zambian Railway in 1970 bisected the forest into the northern and southern fragments which led to removal of the most valuable timber and to agricultural encroachment. The completion of the railway was followed by the establishment of two Ujamaa villages along the railway near Magombera Forest, (Msolwa to the East and Katurukila to the West) and consequently more villages were established as the population grew. In 1980, farmers shifting from the southern side of the railway line were forced by the Wildlife Division to settle in an area west of Msolwa.

In 1980, all authorities agreed that the Magombera Forest should be annexed to Selous Game Reserve. To enable annexation, the Magombera Forest Reserve was degazetted (revoked) in 1982. Nonetheless, no follow up was made until 1992, when authorities learned that the annexation of this forest land to the Selous Game Reserve was never legally completed. As a result, the forest is currently not protected. Lack of protected status seriously threatened the existence of Magombera forest. In 2002, it emerged that 10 sqkm of land between Magombera forest and the Selous Game Reserve, including part of Magombera forest, was under the Illovo Sugar Company for sugarcane growing and the company had proposed to relocate squatters into the Forest area. Following the pressure exerted by conservation NGOs to the Minister for

Natural Resources and Tourism, it was agreed by the Ministry and Illovo Sugar Company that the Magombera Forest would be maintained.

However, the forest continued to be threatened because of its unclear protected area status and lack of management. Recent studies revealed that timber cutting in the area, threatening the rare flora and fauna, and the unique species community (see details under "Ecosystem Profile"). The threats are of further concern as Magombera also has potential value for biological research, ecotourism, and water and soil conservation values.

Through various consultations and meetings it has been revealed that all key stakeholders would like to see that the management of the forest is given to Selous Game Reserve.

The project was executed for 3 years with four targeted conservation outcomes namely;

- Official gazettement of the Magombera Forest
- Annexation of Magombera Forest to the Selous Game Reserve
- Approved land use plans for the areas bordering Magombera Forest
- Documentation of the Magombera biodiversity, its importance and the status of the forest for future management impacts monitoring

All targeted conservation outcomes were achieved except the official gazettement of Magombera Forest and annexation of the same to Selous Game Reserve.

### III. ACHIEVEMENT OF PROJECT PURPOSE

**Project Purpose:** 1) To halt degradation and loss of the Magombera Forest 2) To encourage habitat regeneration 3) To improve land management in the adjacent villages

#### Planned vs. Actual Performance

Indicator	Actual at Completion
<b>Purpose-level:</b>	
<p><b>1. By December 2008, Magombera forest is managed under Selous Game Reserve</b></p>	<p>This process towards achieving this indicator has not yet been completed because the efforts by government to secure alternative land at Ruipa intended to be given to ILLOVO is ongoing. ILLOVO requires that delineation of its land available for annexation (1976Ha) be done after the issue of alternative land at Ruipa is cleared.</p> <p>Despite, various efforts were done including drafting MoU for ILLOVO to handing over management of the Magombera forest to the Wildlife Division through Selous Game Reserve on interim basis waiting for completion of compensation processes (provision of alternative land to ILLOVO). MoU that was proposed by ILLOVO to lease out their land to the Wildlife Division (WD) was rejected by WD; The WD wanted ILLOVO pursuing the possibility of releasing the land entirely for conservation and not in shorter terms. After further consultations the WD agreed to again look at the MOU and review it but this stage was not reached during the project period.</p> <p>To speed up the land compensation process which has been bureaucratic at district level, WWF Tanzania Programme Office is arranging meeting with both Directors of Wildlife and Forestry to update them on the progress so far, who in turn would provide feedback to the Permanent Secretary for Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism, and request him to push at the Ministerial level this long-term outstanding land compensation issue particularly with the Tanzania Sugar Board.</p>
<p><b>2. Baseline data collected for monitoring of habitat and wildlife population trends and regeneration</b></p>	<p>Baseline data collection was completed and the report was finalized in April, 2008 (Ecological Report on Magombera Forest, 2008).</p> <p>The monitoring of primates, human activities and regeneration continued. Significant amount of data have been accumulated for analysis. Though the analysis hasn't been done superficially there is intensification of human activities in the forest while the primates don't have much changes and regeneration has been laggard by human disturbance including major fire in the forest</p>
<p><b>3. By July 2008, land use plans for four villages adjacent to Magombera Forest are in place.</b></p>	<p>4 Village land use plans and 4 by-laws were developed and approved by respective villages and endorsed by Kilombero District Council the Ministry</p>

	of Lands, Housing and Human Settlements Development (Maps attached- Appendix 2a,2b,2c,2d)
--	---

***Describe the success of the project in terms of achieving its intended impact objective and performance indicators.***

A substantial degree of success has already been achieved through community, ward and district levels in approving the process of annexing the Magombera Forest to SELOUS Game Reserve. Other successes includes completion of ecological study of Magombera Forest which has provided baseline information for long term monitoring of forest health, population trends of selected species and illegal activities. Also, approval of participatory village land use plans in 4 villages and initiation of the process of villages to acquire village land certificates so that village councils will have mandate to issue certificates of customary rights of occupancies to individuals/groups/institutions hence enhanced land tenure security. Insecure land tenure resulting from poor land use planning has had negative effects on forest development especially in areas of high population pressure and undefined land use and security of tenure for forestlands. Another success is the initiated dialogue among various stakeholders regarding the importance of annexing the Magombera Forest to SELOUS Game Reserve. Currently, various NGOs continue to put pressure on decision makers to speed up the annexation process. For example, recently UFP circulated a letter to various stakeholders stressing on the value of Magombera and the urgency of conserving it especially following confirmation of the discovery of a new chameleon species in Magombera (*Kinyongia magomberae*) where there were local and world publicity of the Chameleon and the Magombera forest in various media such as internet, journals and Newspaper

***Were there any unexpected impacts (positive or negative)?***

To speed up a Task Force comprising of Wildlife and Forest Division representatives, Selous GR, ILLOVO, Kilombero District Council, UFP and WWF representatives in order to strengthen lobbying and advocacy power to decision makers. Otherwise, the delayed activities have been re-planned and carried forward with no cost-extension to 30th April 2010. Also the current discussions have jumped the initial line of village through wards, district, region and eventually national level and concentrating at ministerial/national level now. Having task force in place, the project facilitated two follow up meetings involving Wildlife and Forest Divisions, ILLOVO, Kilombero District Council, UFP and WWF where some steps to speed up the annexation process was derived and agreed upon. These included exploring the possibility of signing a 3 years interim Magombera forest management agreement between ILLOVO and Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism and submitting various correspondences regarding Magombera forest particularly communications between ILLOVO and the government for almost 10 years now. Kilombero Sugar Company Ltd prepared a letter to WWF-TCO with all communications done between the company and local and central government regarding this issue. WWF -TCO received the correspondences from ILLOVO and covering letter and later compiled those with other information and submitted to the two Directors of Wildlife and Forestry departments for their inputs. To rescue disappearing of Magombera forest by illegal activities, a joint meeting with two Directors of Wildlife and Forest Departments with some members of the Magombera forest Task Force is under way to take place this March 2010 which is aimed at pursuing possibility of an interim conservation measure of ILLOVO handing over their forest land to Wildlife Division to be looked after and sustainably managed along with Selous Game Reserve on three-years contract/MoU agreements (by 30th April 2010) while a longer term solution to compensate ILLOVO with alternative land is being worked out.

Regarding current threats to biodiversity of Magombera forest before its annexation, the Udzungwa Forest Project (UFP; funded by Flamingo Land Zoo, UK) have committed to long-term

monitoring of the forest health, natural resources use, together with conservation education and natural resources planning in nearby villages. According to the UFP the current situation in the forest is deteriorating due to increasing human activities in the forest. This is basically because of absence of a protection status to the forest delayed by long process of securing it. The Environmental Education is taught in the primary schools adjacent to the Magombera forest and this will assist in instigating conservation awareness among the children and passion for nature. Tree plantings were done to the villages and the Kilombero Sugar Company provided some of the seedlings. WWF gave tree seeds to one village (Katurukila) in which with collaboration of UFP the seeds were planted in the village nursery and later given to villagers for planting, this aiming at decreasing the resources use pressure to the Magombera forest.

Procedures to transfer the ownership of the Magombera forest from ILLOVO and Forest department to be annexed to SELOUS game Reserve was unexpectedly delayed due to incomplete processes. Kilombero District Council delayed in clearing land disputes in Ruipa alternative land which requires some people who encroached the land to be compensated. After clearing the dispute then the district council would work on the legal steps to handover the alternative land at Ruipa to ILLOVO. Currently the land valuation exercise at Ruipa (alternative land) which is done by the Kilombero District Council is ongoing.

#### IV. PROJECT OUTPUTS

***Project Outputs:***

**Output 1:**

Magombera Forest is secured for biodiversity conservation and effective land management for the adjacent villages established.

**Output 2:**

Legal annexation of Magombera Forest into the Selous Game Reserve completed

**Output 3:**

Increased communities' awareness on policies and laws governing land and natural resources management around Magombera Forest.

**Output 4:**

Baseline established for long term monitoring of forest health, population trends of selected species and illegal activities

**Planned vs. Actual Performance**

Indicator	Actual at Completion
<p><b>Output 1: Magombera Forest is secured for biodiversity conservation and effective land management for the adjacent villages established.</b></p>	
<p><i>1.1. Magombera Forest is surveyed, mapped and demarcated by July, 2008</i></p>	<p>The Magombera forest was surveyed, demarcated and new map produced which include the ILLOVO Sugar Company Magombera forest land plus the Forest Division forest area (Appendix 1).</p> <p>However, the legal processes for land ownership exchange which includes: Resurvey the ILLOVO land by excluding the ILLOVO</p>

	<p>Sugar Company Magombera forest land area which would be handed to Wildlife Division and preparation of a new Title Deed to ILLOVO with exclusion of Magombera forest area and issuance of land allocation letter to the Wildlife Division to take up the forest land for inclusion in the Selous Game Reserve as an annexure was not completed due to beauracatic processes involved and the usual politics of land compensation</p>
<p><i>1.2. Land use plans are in place for at least four villages by July, 2008</i></p>	<p>Land use plans and by-laws were developed for 4 villages. The plans were approved by respective Village General Assemblies and endorsed by District and the National Land Use Planning Commission. The next step of the process above which involves villages to acquire village land certificates and subsequent issuance of certificate of customary rights of occupancies for individual villagers and institutions/groups is ongoing (expected to be completed by the District Council).</p>
<p><i>1.3. Part of the forest area under Illovo is incorporated in the protected area by December 2008</i></p>	<p>Negotiation on Securing Magombera forest land for conservation and compensating alternative land to ILLOVO was held, community and village, ward and district levels approved the annexation. ILLOVO is also willing and has been at the forefront to facilitate the process. However, compensation for the relinquished land by the Illovo has remained to be a problem. Efforts are being made by Illovo and Kilombero District Council to sort out the matter. In an effort to address this a Task Force comprising of Wildlife and Forest Division, ILLOVO, Kilombero Council, Udzungwa Forest Project and WWF has been formed by the project and has held three meetings to speed up the process.</p> <p>This activity has not yet been completed because the valuation process to compensate people who are already occupying (encroached the land which was not community/village land) the identified alternative land at Ruipa intended to be given to ILLOVO is still ongoing. ILLOVO requires that delineation of its land available for annexation (1976ha) be done after the Ruipa land (alternative land) is cleared.</p>
<p><b>Output 2: Legal annexation of Magombera Forest into the Selous Game Reserve completed</b></p>	<p>This output was not achieved due to delays in finalizing provision of alternative land to ILLOVO as explained in activity 1.3 above</p>
<p><i>2.1. Government notice on the gazettment of Magombera Forest acquired by December 2008</i></p>	<p>Not done – depends on completion of output 1</p>
<p><b>Output 3: Increased communities' awareness on policies and laws governing land and natural resources management around Magombera Forest.</b></p>	
<p><i>3.1. At least 500 representatives of communities adjacent to the forest are sensitized on Natural Resources Policies and conservation values of the Magombera Forest by March 2008.</i></p>	<p>The socio-economic survey was carried out and the final report was produced in August, 2007 (Appendix 3). Communities' sensitization was also done during participatory village lands use plans preparations and during the socio-economic surveys.</p> <p>Village Meetings were held in March, 2008 and communities' agreement on annexation was</p>

	acquired (Appendix 4).
<b>3.2. The gazettelement process is discussed and approved by the District Council and Village General Assemblies by June 2008 as part of the process of implementing the national policy on forests and wildlife management</b>	The gazettelement process was discussed and approved by Village General Assemblies and District Council and approval of gazettelement at village and levels was acquired. Legal documents (Minutes available at village and district levels)
<b>Output 4: Baseline established for long term monitoring of forest health, population trends of selected species and illegal activities</b>	
<b>4.1. Monitoring design protocol established by March, 2007</b>	Method outline were produced and submitted to WWF-TPO by the Consultant, Andrew Marshall.  Consultant engaged and monitoring process was established in March, 2007. 2 villagers and one member of local staff were trained in monitoring methods in March, 2007.  Monitoring protocol is already in place and under implementation by Ecologists and local assistants
<b>4.2. Baseline monitoring of vegetation and primates initiated by end of March, 2007</b>	Baseline data collection was completed and updating of the baseline database has been continuous since 2007. Primate and duiker counts have been carried out twice monthly along two 4km transects. Quantification of forest use along the same transects is now complete. All intended ecological surveys were completed and report was produced (Appendix 5). Monitoring continues as part of long-term evaluation of forest health and management. Monitoring activities have been handed over to the new Udzungwa Project-Flamingo Land, UK
<b>4.3. 2 local staff and 3 village representatives trained in monitoring methods by April,2007</b>	2 villagers and one member of local staff were trained in monitoring methods in March, 2007  In addition to the two village representatives, two further representatives have been trained in methods; New local co-coordinator was introduced in methods and data entry.

***Describe the success of the project in terms of delivering the intended outputs.***

Broadly speaking overall project outputs 3 and 4 have been already achieved. For output 1, only a considerable part of it has been achieved due to the complexity of the issue of alternative land compensation which has remained the major hindrance factor towards legal annexation of Magombera Forest to SELOUS Game Reserve. Project output 2 was not achieved since achievement of this output depends on completion of all other outputs particularly activity 1.3 under output 1.

***Were any outputs unrealized? If so, how has this affected the overall impact of the project?***

Output 2 was not achieved and this implies that if the already initiated negotiation process at Ministerial level is not continued the intended annexation of Magombera Forest to SELOUS Game Reserve will take much longer and this will be posing more dangers to biodiversity of Magombera Forest as the forest will continue to have no legal protection status.

## V. SAFEGUARD POLICY ASSESSMENTS

***Provide a summary of the implementation of any required action toward the environmental and social safeguard policies within the project.***

Not Applicable

## VI. LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE PROJECT

***Describe any lessons learned during the various phases of the project. Consider lessons both for future projects, as well as for CEPF's future performance.***

Project related to land compensation or any other forms of compensation needs longer time to take care of all bureaucratic processes and conflict of interest which in most cases cannot be avoided.

Land is a very sensitive resource particularly for a commercial company like Kilombero Sugar Company (ILLOVO) entirely depending on land as a capital for production. Any decisions on land issues are taking long time to be reached that is why the company is also skeptical to release its land until when they are fully compensated.

Communities had the knowledge that Magombera Forest was part of Selous Game Reserve and therefore they couldn't understand why WWF and its partners were advocating for annexation.

Some villages had already started receiving benefits (classrooms, hospitals) from Selous Game Reserve which helps to cement the relationship between communities and Selous Game Reserve. Villagers are in support of annexation so long as their needs are met.

More awareness among government officials is still needed to make them feel responsible to speed up the annexation process.

***Project Design Process: (aspects of the project design that contributed to its success/failure)***

***Project Execution: (aspects of the project execution that contributed to its success/failure)***

WWF-Tanzania Programme Office has been implementing conservation management and community development projects in the Eastern Arc and Udzungwa Mountains for the past 15 years. Currently, WWF is implementing two projects in the Udzungwa area namely; 1) Improving Natural Resource Use on the Eastern Side of the Udzungwa Mountains National Park (funded by NORAD), and 2) Conservation of *Rungwecebus kipunji* (funded by WWF-Sweden). In addition, WWF-TPO has worked in several forest reserves in the neighboring Eastern Africa Coastal Forests and in Miombo woodland of the Selous Game Reserve and the surrounding areas focusing on improving forest and wildlife management through community-based conservation. A key facet of this work has been to bring together all stakeholders so that a generally acceptable consensus on the complex issues can be reached. These experiences have been quite useful for pushing forward the agenda of annexing the Magombera into the Selous Game Reserve.

Participatory processes used in which community was fully involved in developing village land use plans, ecological and social economic studies and presentations of ecological, socio-economic and land use plans reports at village and ward levels contributed greatly towards securing community approvals of annexing Magombera Forest to Selous Game Reserve.

On the other hand, bureaucratic decisions by some partners, conflict of interest of some village/ward leaders and the sensitivity of issues related to lands have delayed the annexation process of Magombera forest into Selous Game Reserve.

**VII. ADDITIONAL FUNDING**

***Provide details of any additional donors who supported this project and any funding secured for the project as a result of the CEPF grant or success of the project.***

Not applicable

<b>Donor</b>	<b>Type of Funding*</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>Date Received</b>	<b>Notes</b>
		\$		
		\$		
		\$		
		\$		
		\$		
		\$		
		\$		
		\$		

***\*Additional funding should be reported using the following categories:***

- A** *Project co-financing (Other donors contribute to the direct costs of this CEPF project)*
- B** *Complementary funding (Other donors contribute to partner organizations that are working on a project linked with this CEPF project)*
- C** *Grantee and Partner leveraging (Other donors contribute to your organization or a partner organization as a direct result of successes with this CEPF project.)*
- D** *Regional/Portfolio leveraging (Other donors make large investments in a region because of CEPF investment or successes related to this project.)*

***Provide details of whether this project will continue in the future and if so, how any additional funding already secured or fundraising plans will help ensure its sustainability.***

**VIII. ADDITIONAL COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

Annexation process of Magombera forest to Selous Game Reserve will be much easier after doing away with issue of Government allocating alternative land to ILLOVO or provide compensation of another form as will be agreed by two parties since this has been the most difficult step. However, the project has also been pursuing the possibility of an interim

arrangement for ILLOVO and Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism to sign MOU for Magombera forest management for the Wildlife Division to conserve the forest while the compensation issues are being sorted out.

Given the long story of Magombera (ecological importance and its current unprotected status) and the stage reached so far in the course of its annexing to Selous Game Reserve, it is important that additional funding is secured for this project to move on with the unaccomplished steps in the annexation process (i.e project output 2 which was not accomplished during the project time). Also even when annexation process will be accomplished, funding need to be secured thereafter for long-term ecological monitoring by independent researchers, NGOs and villagers and also to support the management of the area under Selous Game Reserve management and community conservation activities in the four villages

## VIII. INFORMATION SHARING

CEPF is committed to transparent operations and to helping civil society groups share experiences, lessons learned and results. One way we do this is by making programmatic project documents available on our Web site, [www.cepf.net](http://www.cepf.net), and by marketing these in our newsletter and other communications.

These documents are accessed frequently by other CEPF grantees, potential partners, and the wider conservation community.

**Please include your full contact details below:**

Name: Proches Hieronimo and Peter Sumbi

Organization name: WWF Tanzania Country Office

Mailing address: P.O.BOX 63117 DAR ES SALAAM, TANZANIA

Tel: +255-22-2775346/2772455

Fax: +255-22-2775535

E-mail: [pheronimo@wwftz.org](mailto:pheronimo@wwftz.org), [psumbi@wwftz.org](mailto:psumbi@wwftz.org)

