

# QUANG NINH MEDIA WORKSHOP PROCEEDINGS

## MONG CAI CITY

17-19 March 2010

### Table of Contents

SUMMARY .....	2
AGENDA .....	3
PARTICIPANT LIST .....	6
PHOTOS FROM WORKSHOP .....	8
GROUP EXERCISE .....	10

## SUMMARY

A journalist workshop was held in March, 19th 2010 for 26 journalists from national and provincial media agencies (including print, online, radio and TV) and the Vietnam Forum for Environmental Journalists. The workshop was held in Mong Cai city, Quang Ninh province on the border of Vietnam-China to hopefully provoke lively discussion and debate on key issues relating to cross-border illegal wildlife trade and to enable them to gather materials for writing via a field trip to legal and illegal cross-border crossings. People and Nature Reconciliation, a local NGO who have extensive experience with domestic media ([www.thiennhien.net](http://www.thiennhien.net)), co-facilitated the workshop and presented on the role of media in tackling wildlife crimes. WCS gave a provocative presentation on wholesale wildlife traders in cross-border trade. The subject of corruption, which goes hand-in-hand with illegal wildlife trade was analyzed by a representative from UN office of drugs and crimes, and one from Vietnam Government Inspection. Environment Police, Customs and Interpol Vietnam helped the journalists look closer at the fight against illegal wildlife trade from different views. TRAFFIC presented the results of their study on inter-agency cooperation. Finally, a well-known journalist who participated in a number of wildlife trade investigations (including the much-publicised one on illegal macaque trade that received international attention) provided advice based on his experiences to encourage others to carry out detailed investigations.

The workshop saw lively discussions between journalists on these key issues and many commitments from journalists that they will carry out investigations of their own. Following the workshop 22 articles were published and 1 TV program broadcast on wildlife trade and farming by participants, highlighting the success of this approach (Please see Table 1) We also provide an appendix with more details about each of these articles. Because many of these articles are also available online we have left the appendix as an Excel spreadsheet so that it is easy to click on the URLs provided. Please be noted that some of the links don't work anymore as the servers at the newspapers changed in the last 3 years). Additionally, an informal network for journalist on wildlife trade issues was formed and led by WCS's communications officer regularly shares stories and leads as they arise.

## AGENDA

### **Objectives:**

This media workshop aims to stimulate increased coverage in the media on key issues relating to cross-border wildlife crimes in Quang Ninh province that will encourage relevant agencies in their task and provide deterrence to wildlife criminals.

### **Outcomes:**

- Increased knowledge of participating journalists on key wildlife crime issues, especially illegal cross-border trade in wildlife
- Stories in the media on illegal wildlife trade are informed and present the relevant issues
- An informal network for journalist on wildlife trade issues is formed

**Time:** 17-19th March 2010

**Location:** Mong Cai, Quang Ninh

### **Participants: 34**

WCS (3): Scott Robertson, Duong Viet Hong, Nguyen Thi Nhung

PanNature (2): Tran Thi Thanh Hai, Nguyen Viet Dung

Resource persons (7): Phi Ngoc Tuyen (Dep of anti-corruption), Giovanni Broussard (UNODC), Tom Osborn (TRAFFIC), Duong Thanh Tung (Thanh Tra Newspaper), Vu Dinh Phu (EP Quang Ninh), Nguyen Thi Minh Nham (Interpol), Nguyen Nam Hai (Customs).

Journalists: National and Provincial (26)

### **Schedule:**

- DAY 1 (17-03): travelling from Hanoi to Mong Cai by car (8 hours). Pick up at Pan Nature's office at 7.30AM. Address: No 3, alley 55, lane 61, Tran Duy Hung, Hà Nội.
- DAY 2 (18-03): In-door workshop
- DAY 3 (19-03): field trip to border-crossings and wildlife farms. Go back to Hanoi.

## Day 2: in-door workshop

18-03-2010

Time	Contents	Facilitator
8:00 – 8:30	Greeting and workshop introduction	PanNature
8:30 – 8:50	<b>The role of media in tackling illegal wildlife trade (PPT)</b> <i>These presentations will illustrate the critical role of media in supporting effective wildlife crime control in Vietnam and ultimately the restoration of Vietnam's biodiversity. Good and bad examples of media coverage will be presented using real articles, successes and failures from Vietnam and if appropriate the region. Example of the article The King Pin and Malaysia's actions afterwards.</i>	PanNature
8:50 – 9:20	<b>Wholesale wildlife traders in cross border trade– The untouchables?</b> <i>Short provocative presentation on the issue followed by a plenary discussion providing opportunity for Q&amp;A from journalists, and what are the key messages that media should focus on in stories.</i>	WCS – Scott Robertson
9:20-9:30	Short film about wildlife	WCS
9:30 – 10:00	<b>Anti-corruption in Vietnam</b>	Department of Anti-corruption
10:00 – 10:15	Tea break	
10:15 – 11:00	<b>Too sensitive to deal with- Corruption and conflict of interest in enforcement of wildlife crimes</b> <i>Short provocative presentation on the issue followed by a plenary discussion providing opportunity for Q&amp;A from journalists, and what are the key messages that media should focus on in stories.</i>	Giovanni Broussard (UNODC)
11:00 - 11:15	Short film about wildlife	WCS
11:15-12:00	<b>Articles on wildlife trade: The good and the bad</b> A group exercise to analyze the main messages and unexpected side-effects of articles on wildlife trade	Participants
12:00-13:15	Lunch	
13:15 – 13:45	<b>Battling wildlife crime from a law enforcement agency view: Environment Police</b> <i>Interesting cases, recent data and how journalists can help the police</i>	Quang Ninh Env Police
13:45 – 14:15	<b>Battling wildlife crime from a law enforcement agency view: Interpol Vietnam</b> <i>Interesting cases, recent data and how journalists can help the police</i>	Interpol Vietnam
14:15-14:25	Short film: illegal trade of tigers	WCS
14:25 – 15:00	<b>Battling wildlife crime from a law enforcement agency view: National Customs</b> <i>Interesting cases, recent data and how journalists can help the customs</i>	Vietnam Customs
15:00 – 15:15	Tea break	
15:15 – 15:45	<b>Experiences of investigations into the illegal wildlife trade</b> <i>One of Vietnam's leading wildlife trade journalists will present his experiences in investigating wildlife crimes, sharing techniques, tips and guidance for the participants, followed by discussions/Q&amp;As with participants.</i>	Duong Thanh Tung
15:45 – 16:30	<b>Inter-agency challenges to effective wildlife crime enforcement:</b> Presentation of the results of a recent WB-FLEG study	TRAFFIC
16:30 – 17:00	<b>Q &amp; A session</b>	All
17:00 – 17:15	Wrap up notes	PanNature
18:00 – 20:00	Dinner	

**Day 3: field trip**

19-03-2010

<b>Time</b>	<b>Activities</b>
7:30- 8:00	Briefing and grouping (5 groups x 6)
8:00-11:00	Ka Long crossing
	Lục Lâm crossing
	Informal crossing near Mong Cai border gate
	Dong Hung market in China
	Wildlife farms
	Agency offices
11:30-12:30	Lunch
12:30-16:30	Go back to Ha Long
16:30-17:30	Dinner
17:30-21:30	Ha Long – Hanoi

## PARTICIPANT LIST

No	Name of participants	Organisation	Email	Tel
1	Anh Việt Hưng	Dân trí		
2	Chị Mỹ Hằng	Tiền Phong		
3	Anh Đỗ Đức Phan	Thời Báo Kinh tế Việt Nam		
4	Anh Đỗ Thế Dũng	Hà Nội Mới		
5	Chi Lam Hạnh	Pháp Luật VN		
6	Anh Nguyễn Hùng Cường	VOV1		
7	Chị Hoài Nguyên	Đời sống & PL		
8	Chị Mỹ Dung	VnMedia		
9	Anh Quang Huy	Báo Quảng Ninh		
10	Anh Việt Phương	Báo Quảng Ninh		
11	Nguyễn Thị Hằng	Báo Quảng Ninh		
12	Phạm Thái Cảnh	Báo Quảng Ninh		
13	Chị Hồ Vĩnh Phú	VTV2		
14	Anh Chu Văn Vui	VTV2 (quay phim)		
15	Anh Thanh Tùng	Thanh Tra		
16	Anh Võ Minh Hải	Gia đình & Xã hội		
17	Chị Phan Tường Vi	VFEJ		
18	Chị Ngô Quỳnh	Truyền hình TTXVN		
19	Anh Phan Thực	Truyền hình TTXVN (quay phim)		
20	Anh Hữu Thông	Nông thôn ngày nay		
21	Anh Quốc Khánh	Sài gòn Giải Phóng tại HN		
22	Chị Nguyễn Hồng Điệp	TTXVN - Bản tin trong nước phòng KHCN&MT		
23	Anh Kiên Trung	VietNamNet		
24	Chị Nguyễn Thanh Loan	Công an nhân dân		
25	Chị Lê Thị Thanh Huyền	Lao Động		
26	Anh Quang Dẫn	Thanh Niên		
27	Trần Quang Tiến	Phó vụ trưởng vụ 1, Văn Phòng Ban chỉ đạo TW về phòng chống tham nhũng.		
28	Phí Ngọc Tuyền	Trưởng Phòng 1, Cục chống tham nhũng		

29	Vũ Đình Phú	Trưởng phòng Phòng cảnh sát môi trường Quảng Ninh		
30	Nguyễn Nam Hải	Cục điều tra chống buôn lậu, Tổng cục Hải quan		
31	Nguyễn Thị Minh Nhâm	Interpol Vietnam		
32	Tom Osborn	TRAFFIC		
33	Giovanni Broussard	UNODC, Associate Expert, Regional Centre for East Asia and the Pacific		
34	Dương Thanh Tùng	Thanh Tra Newspaper		
35	Trần Thị Thanh Hải	PanNature		
36	Nguyễn Việt Dũng	PanNature		
37	Scott Robertson	WCS Vietnam		
38	Nguyễn Thị Nhung	WCS Vietnam		
39	Dương Việt Hồng	WCS Vietnam		

## PHOTOS FROM WORKSHOP



22 reporters and journalists attended







Giovanni Broussard from UNODC talked about the illegal wildlife trade and corruption



Vice head of Quang Ninh provincial Environment Police answered questions from the journalists



Field trip to smuggling points on the border

## GROUP EXERCISE

### Overview

Media has an important role in pointing out wildlife crimes, supporting the law enforcement and educating public about the seriousness of the crime. However there are articles about wildlife crimes that give confusing messages that go against conservation.

### Objectives

To see different approaches towards the same subject bring different messages

Time: 15 minutes for group discussion

30 minutes for 4 group to present

### Questions

- What are the factors that make the article interesting?
- Does the article mention the legal status of the violation and the punishment?
- Does the article advertise wildlife consumption? (Eg. Places to illegally buy wildlife, market price, the scarcity of the products etc.)
- Does the article write about the strong and efficient law enforcement by the agencies?
- Does the article persuade the readers to stand against the consumption and trade of wildlife or promote it?

### **Facilitators**

- Dương Việt Hồng
- Nguyễn Việt Dũng
- Trần Thanh Hải

### **Articles**

- Watching tigers being cooked into tiger balm (Tien Phong newspaper)  
[http://news.socbay.com/tan\\_thay\\_ong\\_ba\\_muoi\\_hoa\\_cao-625539471-33619968.html](http://news.socbay.com/tan_thay_ong_ba_muoi_hoa_cao-625539471-33619968.html)
- The Kingpin (National Geography)  
<http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2010/01/asian-wildlife/christy-text>
- Wildlife meat killed at the Huong Pagoda area (Lao Dong newspaper)  
<http://www.daophatngaynay.com/vn/phatgiao-vn/su-kien-van-de/4184-Kinh-hoang-nan-xa-thit-thu-o-chua-Huong.html?print>
- Cruel monkey killing in Quang Binh (VTV.VN) <http://old.vtv.vn/Article/Get/Giet-khi-tan-doc-o-Quang-Binh-23994a26dc.html>

Table 1: Articles published on wildlife trade right after the workshop

Year	Month	Date	Newspaper	Online		Author	Link to news
2010	March	18-Mar		Sài Gòn Giải phóng	Illegal bush-meat, wildlife trafficking at alarming levels	Quốc Khánh	<a href="http://sggp.org.vn/moitruongdothi/2010/3/221180/">http://sggp.org.vn/moitruongdothi/2010/3/221180/</a>
2010	March	19-Mar		<a href="http://VFEJ.vn">VFEJ.vn</a>	The fight against illegal wildlife trade over borders: Media	VFEJ	<a href="http://www.vfej.vn/vn/chi-tiet/22211/chong-buon-ban-dong-vat-hoang-da-xuyen-bien-gioi-gioi-truyen-thong-nhap-cuoc">http://www.vfej.vn/vn/chi-tiet/22211/chong-buon-ban-dong-vat-hoang-da-xuyen-bien-gioi-gioi-truyen-thong-nhap-cuoc</a>
2010	March	19-Mar		Báo điện tử Đảng Cộng Sản VN	Illegal wildlife trade over borders: Loopholes in laws and	TTXVN	<a href="http://www.cpv.org.vn/cpv/modules/news/newsdetail.aspx?cn_id=394486&amp;co_id=30085thong/4006693.epi#bmMfc4thdTy7">http://www.cpv.org.vn/cpv/modules/news/newsdetail.aspx?cn_id=394486&amp;co_id=30085thong/4006693.epi#bmMfc4thdTy7</a>
2010	March	19-Mar		Sài Gòn Giải phóng	Illegal wildlife trade: not effective remedy	Khánh Nguyễn	<a href="http://www.sggp.org.vn/moitruongdothi/2010/3/221220/">http://www.sggp.org.vn/moitruongdothi/2010/3/221220/</a>
2010	March	19-Mar		Biên Phòng	Illegal bush-meat, wildlife trafficking at	Theo SGGP	<a href="http://www.bienphong.com.vn/nd5/detail/phap-luat/doi-song-phap-luat/chi-phat-hien-duoc-so-">http://www.bienphong.com.vn/nd5/detail/phap-luat/doi-song-phap-luat/chi-phat-hien-duoc-so-</a>
2010	March	22-Mar	Hà Nội mới		Only about 20% of illegal wildlife trade	Thế Dũng	<a href="http://hanoimoi.com.vn/newsdetail/xa_hoi/316160/chi-khoang-20-so-vu-buon-ban-dong-vat-">http://hanoimoi.com.vn/newsdetail/xa_hoi/316160/chi-khoang-20-so-vu-buon-ban-dong-vat-</a>
2010	March	22-Mar		Vietnamnews	Illegal bush-meat, wildlife trafficking at	VNS	<a href="http://vietnamnews.vnagency.com.vn/Environment/197884/Illegal-bush-meat-wildlife-trafficking-">http://vietnamnews.vnagency.com.vn/Environment/197884/Illegal-bush-meat-wildlife-trafficking-</a>

2010	March	23-Mar		VFEJ.vn	The collapse of the eco-system will put	Phan Vi	<a href="http://www.vfej.vn/vn/chi_tiet/22270/he_sinh_t_hai_sup_do_se_de_doa_cuoc_song_con_nguoi">http://www.vfej.vn/vn/chi_tiet/22270/he_sinh_t_hai_sup_do_se_de_doa_cuoc_song_con_nguoi</a>
2010	March	23-Mar		VietNews	Experts warns against wildlife trade	VNA	<a href="http://www.vietnews.vn/News/Society/13556/Experts-warns-against-wildlife-trade-in-">http://www.vietnews.vn/News/Society/13556/Experts-warns-against-wildlife-trade-in-</a>
2010	March	25-Mar		Thanh tra	Trans-border illegal wildlife trade: the	Dương Thanh	<a href="http://www.thanhtra.com.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=65&amp;newsid=27596">http://www.thanhtra.com.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=65&amp;newsid=27596</a>
2010	March	25-Mar		Thanh niên	WCS expert finds poachers, traffickers	Source: VNA	<a href="http://www.thanhniennews.com/2010/Pages/WWF-expert-finds-poachers-traffickers-erasing-">http://www.thanhniennews.com/2010/Pages/WWF-expert-finds-poachers-traffickers-erasing-</a>
2010	March	25-Mar		Phap luat va doi song	2010:Tigers can be extinced	Bui Van Huan	<a href="http://www.doisongphapluat.com.vn/story.aspx?id=3484&amp;lang=vn&amp;zone=22&amp;zoneparent=0">http://www.doisongphapluat.com.vn/story.aspx?id=3484&amp;lang=vn&amp;zone=22&amp;zoneparent=0</a>
2010	March	26-Mar		Thanh tra	Challenges in the fight against illegal	Dương Thanh	<a href="http://www.thanhtra.com.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=55&amp;newsid=27638">http://www.thanhtra.com.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=55&amp;newsid=27638</a>
2010	March	28-Mar	Lao Động		Big profit, low punishment	Huyền Lê	<a href="http://www.laodong.com.vn/Home/Loi-nhuan-lon-xu-phat-nhe/20103/178863.laodong">http://www.laodong.com.vn/Home/Loi-nhuan-lon-xu-phat-nhe/20103/178863.laodong</a>
2010	March	28-Mar	Lao Động		Law loopholes	Huyền Lê	<a href="http://www.laodong.com.vn/Home/Lo-hong-phap-ly/20103/178867.laodong">http://www.laodong.com.vn/Home/Lo-hong-phap-ly/20103/178867.laodong</a>
2010	March	28-Mar	Lao Động		More detailed laws, more loopholes	Huyền Lê	_
2010	March	28-Mar		Baomoi v Lao dong	More detailed laws, more loopholes	Huyền Lê	<a href="http://www.baomoi.com/Home/PhapLuat/laodong.com.vn/Luat-cang-cu-the-cang-ho/4047062.epi">http://www.baomoi.com/Home/PhapLuat/laodong.com.vn/Luat-cang-cu-the-cang-ho/4047062.epi</a>

2010	March	22-Mar		UNODC	Vietnamese media focus on wildlife		<a href="http://www.unodc.org/eastasiaandpacific/en/2010/03/wildlife-trafficking/story.html">http://www.unodc.org/eastasiaandpacific/en/2010/03/wildlife-trafficking/story.html</a>
2010	April	12-Apr		VFEJ.vn	Quang Ninh Officers participated in wildlife	Pham Manh	<a href="http://www.vfej.vn/vn/chi_tiet/22745/can_bo_quang_ninh_tham_gia_khoa_tap_huan_bao_ve_do">http://www.vfej.vn/vn/chi_tiet/22745/can_bo_quang_ninh_tham_gia_khoa_tap_huan_bao_ve_do</a>
2010	April	13-Apr		Kiem Lam vung I	Quang Ninh: Training on species ID		<a href="http://kiemlamvung1.org.vn/newsdetail.asp?x=238&amp;y=14">http://kiemlamvung1.org.vn/newsdetail.asp?x=238&amp;y=14</a>
2010	April	13-Apr		Bao Cong An ND	Động vật hoang dã lên bàn nhậu	Hải Yến	<a href="http://www.congan.com.vn/?mod=detnews&amp;catid=702&amp;p=&amp;id=57206">http://www.congan.com.vn/?mod=detnews&amp;catid=702&amp;p=&amp;id=57206</a>
2010	May	24-May		Kinh te nong thon	Warning on the wildlife trade	Huu Nguyen	<a href="http://www.kinhtenongthon.com.vn/Story/2010/5/23345.html">http://www.kinhtenongthon.com.vn/Story/2010/5/23345.html</a>
2010	June	9-Jun		Kinh te nong thon	Gay nuoi DVHD o VN: bao ton hay tham sat	Huu Nguyen	<a href="http://kinhtenongthon.com.vn/Story/2010/6/23588.html">http://kinhtenongthon.com.vn/Story/2010/6/23588.html</a>