

Process Framework for Involuntary Restriction on Access to Resources

1. **Date:** 1 December 2015
2. **Grant No.** 65951
3. **Grantee:** WCS
4. **Title:** Strengthening Community Based Coastal and Marine Resource Management in the North Sulawesi Corridor
5. **Location:**
 - Country: Indonesia
 - Province: North Sulawesi
 - A. District: North Minahasa
 - Villages: - Linuhu and Pulisan (Likupang Timur Sub-district)
 - Tambun, Tanah Putih and Tarabitan (Likupang Barat Sub-district)

 - B. District: Siau, Tagulandang, Biaro (Sitaro)
 - Villages: - Buhias, Mohongsawang, Sakindara, Tapile (Siau Timur Selatan Sub-district)
 - Makalehi (Siau Barat Sub-district)

6. Project Background

The CEPF priority marine corridor of North Sulawesi covers an area of 61,393 km², and supports approximately 200,000 people, 40% of whom depend on coastal resources for their livelihoods. In this proposed project, we aim to establish formally recognized management boundaries, regulations and operations to improve management in a minimum of 10 community based marine protected areas (CB-MPAs) covering approximately 85 hectares in the villages of Linuhu, Pulisan, Tambun, Tanah Putih and Tarabitan in North Minahasa District and approximately 100 hectares in the villages of Buhias, Makalehi, Mohongsawang, Sakindara and Tapile in Sitaro District.

Over the past 5 years, WCS with government and community partners, has demonstrated a commitment to improving natural resource management in the marine corridor of North Sulawesi. There is a high level of willingness and support from local communities, the North Minahasa and Sitaro District Governments and the Provincial Government of North Sulawesi to engage in approaches that strengthen community-based MPA management and forge institutional, management and policy integration with existing and proposed government MPAs.

From 2011 to 2014, with support from NOAA and the David and Lucile Packard Foundation, we assisted communities in 25 villages in North Minahasa District to develop management and action plans for 25 CB-MPAs including regulations for no fishing areas, promotion of traditional fishing practices and bans on destructive in each. These efforts were well-received by local fishers and local leaders resulting in a reduction in bomb fishing and other destructive fishing practices, in and around some CB-MPAs. In six of these villages, we have facilitated the design of CB-MPA boundaries and resource use regulations, with implementation by local village laws and management units. Recently local leaders an additional 5 villages have expressed willingness to also develop CB-MPAs in their villages and are supportive of establishing local management units, regulations, boundaries, zoning plans and operations. Additional funding from the USAID-Marine Protected Area Governance Program (USAID-MPAG) over this period assisted with connecting local village regulations in North Minahasa into District level MPA policies and regulations, with 21 CB-MPAs (407.2 ha), located in the sub-district of Likupang, now located within a larger MPA (26,794 ha), decreed by the District Government of North Minahasa. This work involved

consultation with all villages of the concept of developing local CB-MPAs to be supported within a larger district level MPA. The funding also helped us identify five villages in Sitaro District who are amenable to adopting CB-MPA management, but to date no CB-MPAs exist here. In the District of Sitaro, encompassing the islands of Siau, Taggulandang and Biaro, WCS and partners have also initiated participatory planning processes with local community leaders and communities for the development of a Sitaro District MPA covering 57,099 ha.

Regulating access to marine areas and behavior with regard to marine resource use can potentially disproportionately disadvantage marginalized and poor sectors of the community. This may include people without access to boats and those who are highly dependent on nearshore marine waters for subsistence income and food. To ensure that people are not disadvantaged, all village regulations will be developed through consensual and participatory community processes that are agreed to by all sectors (not just elites and community leaders), taking account of poor sectors of the communities with no access to boats, promoting traditional fishing practices and supporting development of village rights to their fishing resources, and re-building depleted fisheries. Often people from outside villages, who practice exploitative and illegal activities (eg. bomb fishing) are most impacted and disadvantaged by CB-MPAs as a heightened vigilance and awareness is created by CB-MPA management units. Through participatory planning processes and cross-village visits and information sessions, we will also attempt to promote understanding of neighboring communities of the need for banning destructive fishing and supporting traditional fishing practices and village CB-MPAs. To provide incentives to all communities to adopt and support CB-MPA regulations we will build local knowledge and capacity to establish operational management functions for community-based MPAs and disseminate lessons from successful CB-MPAs through cross-village visits to share information, leadership skills, regulatory approaches and technical skills with adjacent villages .

The long-term impact of this project is through 1) Improved marine ecosystem habitats for nine priority species; and 2) Positive economic benefits realized in ten villages, affecting 100 people, from CB-MPAs delivering increased sustainable fish-catch and tourism. Short term outcomes include; 1) Ten villages with legally designated and fully functional CB-MPAs covering approximately 185 hectares; 2) Ten village governments, two district governments, and two local NGOs collaboratively managing a functional CB-MPA Network and 3) Approximately more than 100 community members and 4 local NGO staffs with improved skills in the management of their marine resources.

Project preparation

The project we are presenting was prepared incorporating our knowledge of:

1. The local marine resource use and status and socioeconomic conditions from previous surveys conducted in both Districts.
2. The willingness of local village leaders and communities to engage in planning and implementation of the participatory processes for CB-MPAs;
4. The responses of district and provincial governments to provide additional support for MPA and CB-MPA development;
5. WCS and partners knowledge and experience of the feasibility of implementation of CB-MPAs given the socioeconomic differences among individual villages;
6. Meetings with village and NGO partners (Manengkel Solidaritas, Rumah Ganesa) and district and village governments to maintain the political and social momentum and support for planning and implementing the North Sulawesi network of CB-MPAs.

Five project components were identified based on these consultations, and these components outline the objectives and approach of the project:

1. Under Component 1, through consultations with local village leaders and communities, we will gather and disseminate information on ecological, socioeconomic and governance conditions to help communities with information to improve overall awareness and support for sustainable and effective coastal and marine resource management. The information will be used in social awareness activities and meetings to discuss and promote the functions and benefits of CB-MPA development in target villages. Cross-village meetings will also facilitate the sharing of lessons of the benefits of regulations and operations to protect marine habitats, build back reef fishery resources and species from destructive and exploitative practices.
2. Under Component 2, to build community support for improved marine resource management, we will facilitate participatory public meetings with communities and governments to build consensus, draft village regulations, develop management and zoning plans and establish management units for each CB-MPA. The design and establishment of village regulations and MPA boundaries will be guided by community and scientific knowledge of the marine environment and resources, principles of ecological viability and resilience, social preferences for sanctions and community norms regarding management approaches. The range of regulations, including fishery closures, fishing gear restrictions and species restrictions will be established through appropriate village planning and legal processes, including involvement of the full range of community stakeholders and representatives to ensure that differences in views and opinions within villages are accounted for, and that all regulations have strong community and government support. Community management units will be established to enforce regulations and conduct management operations for each of the 10 CB-MPAs. For this objective WCS will also work closely with district and provincial governments to develop the policy and legal support for CB-MPA regulations so they are recognized in government MPAs and government spatial management plans, which will assist in obtaining additional support towards funding local management of these areas.
3. Under Component 3, we will help implement the functional operations of the 10 MPAs, by building relationships with community stakeholders and conducting CB-MPA participatory planning. The planning work will identify the targeted project resources and the training programs needed for each of the 10 CB-MPA management units and community stakeholders. Resources and training will then be provided by WCS to build leadership and management capacity. Social cohesion and collaboration among villages will also be key factor that drives support for CB-MPAs in the region. Through cross-village visits and sharing of information on leadership and management skills, regulations and operations, we aim to build village constituencies that support ongoing CB-MPA management and compliance.
4. Under Component 4, will build capacity in local NGOs to facilitate sustained and improved management of each CB-MPA. Formal training will be provided to staff from local NGOs in MPA management, including collection and analysis of data, spatial planning, policy development processes, MPA management and zoning plan design and MPA management. This will aim to enable local people to help with management of CB-MPAs during the project and beyond its life.

5. Under Component 5, we will apply the CEPF social safeguard on restriction on access to resources. Semi-annual reports on implementation of the Process Framework will report on impacts of the project on local communities.
6. Under Component 6, we will manage sub-grants to local NGOs (Manengkel Solidaritas and Rumah Ganesha). The sub-grants will be used to cover salaries for two local NGO staffs (one from each NGO) and administration costs.

7. Participatory Implementation

To build the CB-MPA Network in objective 1 we will work with village leaders and communities to collect the relevant ecological and socioeconomic information used to understand the issues influencing marine resource use management. This will also build awareness and support for sustainable marine resource use. The approach will use information and lessons learned from nearby CB-MPAs that are more advanced in terms of management implementation and have demonstrated improvements in marine resource recovery. Building support among villages encourages communities to participate and eventually become the key drivers of natural resource management planning processes which culminate in development of CB-MPA boundaries, local management and zoning plans and legally binding regulations and management actions for implementation. WCS also will participatory planning by village governments and stakeholders with staff from higher level government agencies, to vertically integrate MPA policies from village through to province levels. It also builds the broader policy and regulatory support for CB-MPAs, enabling village management units to operationalize management, zoning plans and targeted management actions.

The development and implementation of action plans by the management units established throughout the project will help to build capacity at the community level. To build a broader support base and local constituencies for the CB-MPA network in North Sulawesi, we will also facilitate meetings among CB-MPA villages and their neighbouring fishing villages that build awareness of practical management measures (eg. fishing regulations, deployment of marker buoys around no fishing zones), to mitigate poaching and destructive fishing activities by all fishers. At higher governance levels, WCS will engage with district and provincial agencies to develop the policy and legal support for each of the CB-MPA regulations so they are recognized in larger government MPAs that are being planned, and harmonized with relevant government spatial management plans. This will assist with leveraging additional support and funding for these areas from government sources.

8. Criteria for eligibility of affected persons

For the CB-MPA Network of North Sulawesi the affected people will be defined as those who live in villages adjacent to the 10 proposed CB-MPA villages, those people including women that have limited to no access to boats and are therefore heavily reliant on nearshore fishing practices. During the planning and zoning processes for each CB-MPA, we will fully engage with these people to obtain a better understanding of their fishing practices. Fishing regulations and zones will then be designed with their input to minimize impacts on these people. Particular emphasis will be on working with people who have limited to no access to boats and women's groups who harvest intertidal marine resources, to ensure that their subsistence fishing is not adversely impacted by CB-MPA regulations. Other people that may practice unsustainable and illegal fishing practices may also be in conflict with regulations established by village communities. To mitigate these fishing practices, we will facilitate cross-site visits between village management leaders from two villages, and the 10 proposed CB-MPAs, to share lessons

on standard operational procedures in surveillance, reporting and enforcement that we have helped previously establish for these two villages. These two villages provide models of village based enforcement that can be shared among the proposed 10 villages and adjacent villages to promote awareness of management and enforcement, and deliver the awareness and incentives for all fishers to co-operate with all established village regulations.

Measures to assist the affected persons

The measures required to assist those people and families that will be most affected by the creation of the CB-MPAs will be discussed through participatory meetings with representation of all community views, as part of the zoning process for each CB-MPA and as part of the design of village laws and regulations. This will enable zoning of habitats that are used for subsistence fisheries to be zoned for traditional fishing practices while protecting them from unsustainable and destructive fishing activities. New livelihood opportunities also provide incentives for community support for CB-MPA regulations, and although livelihood development is not a key objective in this proposed project, in each village we will work with all stakeholders to identify opportunities for economic development (eg. tourism, handicraft and homestay businesses) with funding from other sources.

9. Conflict resolution and complaint mechanism

The main groups that may be likely to have negative perceptions of CB-MPA development are poor and marginalised people who are highly dependent on subsistence resource use and poachers from nearby villages. For poor and marginalized people within a village where a CB-MPA is being developed, we believe that many of their concerns can be dealt with during participatory village planning meetings on the design of CB-MPA zones and regulations using legal and social structures and processes, including conflict resolution practices within the village. For issues regarding potential negative impacts from the CB-MPAs on people, these people will be able to lodge formal complaints and enter conflict resolution processes with village governments, to resolve disputes and concerns. We would propose that bi-annual meetings are held at a minimum with the village governments, management units and local community members to discuss issues arising from the zoning and regulations of CB-MPAs. Creating a forum where all parties can share their concerns can help diffuse friction, allow problems to be aired and identify mechanisms to resolve conflicts where necessary. WCS staff in Sulawesi can act to facilitate such meetings, and these practices will be developed as part of management unit development within each village. For people who commonly poach and practice destructive fishing practices (eg. bomb-fishing), WCS will work closely with village leaders from all villages in the vicinity to advocate the benefits of CB-MPAs and identify concerns and issues that may lead to these practices. Standard operating procedures for community surveillance and enforcement of new fishing regulations and illegal activities, including the development of graduated sanctions, where first offenders are provided with warnings and education on the benefits of complying with fishing regulations, will be developed using an integrated approach among communities and relevant government agencies. Such procedures aim to build awareness and support for surveillance and reporting of destructive fishing, ensure violations are followed up by management units and government agencies (eg. local police), assist with conflict resolution approaches and promote traditional fishing practices among villages so that people that may be affected by new fishing regulations, are able to reap benefits from recovery of fish habitats and stocks.

10. Implementation Arrangements

- Manage participatory collection of ecological, socioeconomic and governance data at each village for information required for spatial planning and delineation of each CB-MPA: Community Officers (TBD), Communications Officer (TBD).
- Facilitate communication among community stakeholders including leading community meetings at the 10 villages to promote awareness of CB-MPAs and initiate MPA planning processes: Community Officers (TBD), Communications Officer (TBD), Local NGOs (Manengkel Solidaritas, Rumah Ganesa).
- Ensure CB-MPA Management Units are created that include representative stakeholders: Community Officers (TBD).
- Facilitate meetings between community stakeholders in each village and local government agencies at district and provincial levels for harmonization of CB-MPA and Provincial/District MPA planning - Sonny Taswidjawa (Sulawesi Co-ordinator), Marine and Fisheries Agencies (MFA), Planning and Regional Development Agency (BAPPEDA).
- Development of management and zoning plans and standard operating procedures with village management units and law enforcement agencies (eg. marine police / Polairud): Sonny Taswidjawa (Sulawesi Co-ordinator).
- Supervise field activities conducted by the community and communication officers, and provide technical training for relevant partners and supervise deployment of CB-MPA infrastructure (eg. buoys, signs) for MPA boundary delineation and awareness: Sonny Taswidjawa (Sulawesi Co-ordinator), Local NGOs (Manengkel Solidaritas, Rumah Ganesa).
- Facilitate regular bi-monthly meetings are held by CB-MPA Management Units and semi-annual Village Stakeholder meetings to allow for continued community input, comment, or complaint: Sony Taswidjawa. Sulawesi Co-ordinator), Local NGOs (Manengkel Solidaritas, Rumah Ganesa).
- Collate and analyse existing data, conduct gap analyses for ecological and socio-economic datasets and CB-MPA management capacity and document project outputs (eg. reports, meeting notes, photo documentation: PrayektiNingtias (Senior Program Officer).
- Oversee policy reform, design processes and MPA decrees at district and provincial levels: Yudi Herdiana (Team Leader), Marine and Fisheries Agencies (MFA), Planning and Regional Development Agency (BAPPEDA).

11. Monitoring and Evaluation

Monitoring and evaluation of the performance of the project will be performed through the gathering, analysis and dissemination of changes in ecological, socioeconomic and governance conditions that are indicators of improved and effective coastal and marine resource management. The number of trainings, people trained, the number of legitimate management units established, the number of legally binding management regulations established and the number of management operations conducted will be monitored across all CB-MPAs and used to evaluate improvements in community institutions and improved local capacity and operational management functions. We will apply the CEPF social safeguard framework to assess restrictions on access to resources through regular bi-weekly visits to each CB-MPA, bi-monthly meetings held by CB-MPA Management units and semi-annual Village Stakeholder meetings to allow for continued community input, comment, or complaint. All bi-monthly and semi-annual meetings will be fully documented by minutes of meetings, identifying people and institutions in attendance by signature, summarizing key observations and discussions of affected members needs and complaints and the identifying the solutions applied to address issues and conflicts.

12. Monitoring and evaluation Arrangements

Periodic site visits using monitoring tools (focus groups discussions, interviews with village leaders and village members, participatory planning sessions) will be used to assess ongoing processes of CB-MPA planning, zoning and regulation development, management unit establishment and operations, and identify conflicts and issues negatively affecting community stakeholders. The results of these meetings will be documented as “minutes of meetings” with descriptions of issues discussed, the resolutions and outcomes, confirmed by signing by members present and then disseminated to communities. Community stakeholder participatory meetings will decide on the design of boundaries and zones for each CB-MPA, with community management units determining and recording boundaries using GPS surveys. Identification of potential community members likely to be affected most by the planning and zoning process will take place at community meetings and where possible we will aim to minimize negative impacts to village members. Where this is not possible we will explore options for mitigation and these will be documented in the minutes and descriptions of each meeting.